

SEAFORE Masterclass Series

Sat, 12/11 2:29PM • 3:35:50

SUMMARY KEYWORDS

movements, resistance, journalists, reporting, southeast asia, asean, protests, media, government, countries, malaysia, social movements, myanmar, political, zakia, civil society, state, put, alternative, development

SPEAKERS

Participant, Muhammad Adib Faiz, Danny Yong, Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom, Dr Eduardo C. Tadem, Zakiah Koya, Dr Khoo Ying Hooi

00:00

yeah yeah,

Danny Yong 00:03

anytime when you put up the slides I can start that Okay, so I'll just start anyway, as the rest comes in come in. So today is masterclass seven. Welcome everybody to the SEAFORE Southeast Asia forum for reporting matter. This masterclass is on democracy in a Power to the People democracy, civil society and resistance in Southeast Asia. So let me do a quick introduction. Oh, yes. Yeah. Okay, so I'm from Kini Academy. My name is Danny Yong Kini Academy is a trading arm of Malaysiakini group. Yeah. And we mainly involved in the training of journalists, I like to I like to say we've evolved to a little bit more than that we are in media development now. So journalism training, we've been very involved with investigative reporting the past two years. And we have we've got a, you know, run, we run projects that trains journalists and other interested parties on investigative journalism track technique, as well as we have them guarded chase down stories. And if you want to you can, you can check us out like Fiji, asia.com, Fiji being funds for investigative journalism initiatives. And this past year, we've also been working on collaborations within ASEAN, so to to help journalists get together know each other better and encourage encourage more cross border reporting and cross border cooperation. Right. And of course, SEAFORE is one of our efforts. Yes. So first, let us give thanks to our sponsors, the Institute of War and Peace reporting, is headquartered in London. And the ultimate, the ultimate sponsor for these, this project is the US. And they they've been very supportive with us. Originally, this, this masterclass series is only five, they've agreed for us to add two more, you know, which is why we have seven master classes today being the last one. Let's go. Okay, so what we are trying to do with this project is to encourage journalists to engage with other journalists in ASEAN. So this project presents two overlaps. One overlap is the journalists are all from the same reporting desks. So obviously, they have a lot more in common than, you know, for instance, journalists that report on sports, for instance. So that that's the first thing, the second thing is to have them connect on ASEAN

related topics. So by nature, the ASEAN related topics tend to be more regional and more cross border in nature. And this, this is how we also want to encourage this potential collaborations. So we want to do this and sustain way sustain meaning, this is not a one time effort, we plan to repeat this next year. We've already got 10 newsrooms that are together to co publish all the articles from here, I'll tell you more about it in a while. So, SEAFOR has got three main components. One, obviously is the Master Class series, we have seven, you want to check out more about the rest of our the master classes earlier on, you can go to SEAFOR.org. You can you can find the recordings of both the master classes. You can you can find the slides and even transcripts. Yeah. Second thing is, as I mentioned, there are there are 10/11 newsrooms that are part of this project from ASEAN as well as Timor Leste. And they each work on reporting project in which a grant has been generously given to them by IWPR so the third section, the third component is really a forum is really the getting together of journalists. So we have a WhatsApp group that we welcome all journalists to, to be part of. And so obviously all the journalists even though they are even some who are not part of the project has jumped onto that Whatsapp group. So you know, the idea is, they already would have have the capability to reach out whether in a group or via private message, right? And SEAFOR.org will be the central place, there's actually even a forum there, although it's not super active. Yeah. Okay, let's move on. Coming to our master class today. So the idea of the master classes, as we put it, put them together is to get ASEAN voices to chime in and to present their perspectives to all these topics that we have. We have we have selected and and so today we have we have four such people, we have Zakiah, we have, you know, Dr Khoo, we have Dr Welyne, Dr. Eduardo, and obviously, all ASEAN base, I will leave the main the real introductions to Zakiah later. So, before we start, do have your mics on mute. That doesn't mean we don't encourage conversation. We we love for this to to be lively discussion. And that's exactly why we have this for eminent speakers with us so that you journalists and everybody else can jump in and get their opinions on things. So even more important for journalists who be who might be writing stories on this subject matter. This is your opportunity to, to squeeze in a few questions to run off your run of your report. Right. So we encourage you to leave your video on and do submit questions and comments. As I mentioned, we hope we really hope that this will be a discussion whether you want to sit on video and ask a question live or you can put in the chat box, you can type in the chat box, our team will check in on the chat box to to take the questions. Alright, this session is being recorded. So we will have the recording available in a few days within our in our website as well as our YouTube channel. Right. Additionally, in our YouTube channel, we actually will break it up in into into different sections of for for each speaker. Alright. So if you have missed part of this, you can actually go back in there and and and check out the videos. So we did a poll before on this just before our master class to get how you find you guys feel about our subject matter. So So we asked a question. As a journalist, how often do you cover protests or resistance movements? So there's a fourth of you that says Never? Frankly, I was a bit. I'm a bit surprised with that, considering so many. So many things has been happening in Southeast Asia, including in Malaysia. Of course, we all know that. So let's move on. I'd be keen to get these guys to ask a couple of questions and tell us why right? How familiar are you with the history of resistance movements in Southeast Asia? So only one out of eight say that you're not familiar? This is a perfect opportunity. C four is about learning as well. And, you know, everybody seems to be a little bit more than familiar than with our resistance movements. How important is protests and resistance in your country? Thankfully, you know, most of you say yes, it's really important. I hope this person who's I don't think it's important coming from really peace loving country, I guess. Okay, let's move on. In your

country, which of these issues are frequently raised during protests? Most important, one most important ones that stood out is free and fair elections, then women's rights. And on third is indigenous rights, environmental concerns corruption, and discrimination. So, you know, this this is because I'm areas you're going to touch on touch on as well, too. Let's move on. In your country, does art of visual culture act as a form of protest or resistance? 1/4 says no. So I guess there's an opportunity for political cartoonists to kind of spread their wings to this country. We had to find out for them. To what extent do civil society organizations in your country collaborate with others such organizations in Southeast Asia This is something interesting really even for me for is right sitting right on the fence. I would love to I would love to hear from the speakers of what civil societies have been doing to collaborate with other such organizations we tend to be involved with and with our own countries, especially those of us who are from countries who are quite a little bit troubled, right. So this might give opportunities or other suggest to other civil civil society organizations on a way to collaborate with each other outside the country. Great, beautiful collaboration. So let's get to the main event. So I will give a quick introduction of Zakiah. Her section is resistance media's struggle to report it as it is. So Zakiah she's a senior journalist. She is a writer, editor producer. She started back in 95 as a feature writer in The Sun. She's, she's got many years as a journalist, so she's worked with multiple organizations including New Straits Times, Malaysiakini, aka, TV pass MMP Malaysia, Malay mail, The Heat, Astro Awani and the star. So we're the cause of the career, her career. Zakia has taken many role in the media including reporting, translation, event management and production and managing newsroom. This is really quite unique from my knowledge of, of journalists. But her focus has always been politics and politicians, although she loves writing about the common man and his life. So in the late 90s, she covered reformasi street protests in Malaysia. So you reformasi being one of the rallying cry in Malaysia, conducting conducted investigative reporting into battling giants ratio riots, that's one area in Klang Valley, and she wrote the analysis and combat commentaries on socio political issues. She's conducted many interviews with, you know, high profile personalities including Tariq Ramadan, Datuk Sri Nick Aziz, the former head of the late head of house. Datuk Sri Anwar Ibrahim to Dr. Mahathir, Datuk Sri Najib Razak Datuk Sri Abdulhadi Awang and many others. For Zakiah, journalist duty is always to ask the hard questions, even if you know you will not get replied. So I'll hand this over to Zakiah. The floor is yours.

Zakiah Koya 12:49

Thank you, Danny. I hope I'm loud and clear. Salamwailaikum, and a very good afternoon to everyone. I'll be facilitating this class today. It's my first monster class. So I'd go by I will do you justice, you know, for spending your time in this monster class. As you know, I have been reporting politics. Most of the time, it's reporting politicians, it's not politics, because of the, you know, the what you called the laws and stuff that we have here in Malaysian media. And I have worked in both the pro government I have been on the side in new straight times, it was a very pro government. But at a time when we were allowed to also interview opposition. And then I've also worked with Taraka, which is the past the opposition at a time when they were opposition now the government, so opposition party organ. And also then I also worked with Misha Kinney despite very short time, but a very, very meaningful time in my career. It's an honor for me to be with so many journalists and academicians and people who are interested in this discourse. And I'll just go before I start, let us just recap the Resistance movements that we have in Southeast Asia with a short video. Okay, so that was a very short video just to recap for you know what the so what is happening in Southeast Asia and what happened in Southeast Asia.

Before we begin the class, I would like to present my keynote presentation and I've taken it. I've titled it resistance media struggle to report it as it is. Because that is the responsibility of a journalist, a true journalist reports it as it is without any salt and pepper. The reason I use the word resistance is because in Southeast Asia it could we keep it to that. Yeah, the reason I use the word resistance is because in Southeast Asia we have many types of resistance. And this word encompasses all kinds of fights rebellion, uprising unhappiness and unspeaking of the authorities. While we usually talk about resistance from the people, the masses and the idea of resistance gives us the picture of you know, 1000s of people on the protests, in protests on the streets demanding for their rights. Over the years, resistance has taken on different forms. And with a new media social media resistance need not only happen on the streets, but can even be successful in silent forms, on tweets and Instagrams. We saw this at the beginning of the Arab Spring, especially in Egypt, when Internet became the major tool for the US to feel the resistance against President Hosni Mubarak before people took to the streets. So the rising started on the internet itself. Sometimes it need not be resistance from the people, but also from within the government such as political parties within the government, and then overthrowing the government from within, which happened not only once, but twice in the past two years in Malaysia. We had the case of, you know, Pakatan harapan, the opposition winning the 2018 general elections for the first time I'm sitting 60 years old party which, you know, ruled the government for for so long. And then among themselves in Pakatan harapan, there was a breakaway. And then they work together with those, the opposition then and they overthrew the government, and then due to a movement called Shelton Sheraton move, and after that, within that new government of which was called ricotta national. There was another resistance from the party itself from from another party, and that again, brought to a government downfall and now we have a preta national base and national government. So, this these are also resistance which the media He struggles to report because many of us journalists who are close to politicians, we know these things are happening these things are you know, happening around under the ground, but it cannot be written even we cannot write all this ministers fighting with this minister and then there's gonna be a government downfall in the next few you know a few days we cannot write that because we we are governed by the laws and we also have to worry call me be careful of clampdown by by the powers that be that may think that we are out to unseat them. So, that's why, you know, these are there are many types of resistance, which the media struggles to report. Many of these things we write between the lines and the attempts by media, while they write these things is to apiece the powers that were okay and then the powers that be and the powers that will be, so that that is a fine line. I think a lot of the media in the in Malaysia is playing, and also in most of the countries in South Asia. Okay. Slide three, please. I believe resistance happens in all aspects. And it can rise from within the very poor and the very rich or everyone, especially when the country's authorities do not listen to the masses. There are types of resistance, which can be very political oriented, which is what we hear about everyday. Everybody thinks when we talk about resistance is all political is not. Okay. While there are many other resistance movements, which stem from social and economic reasons, actually, the other two social economy, actually, are the main causes that lead towards political resistance, the lines are very blurred actually. But the usual causes of resistance are social and economic unhappiness, it's just common sense. A man welfare and, you know, having all these needs taken care of do not, does not usually take to the streets or does not resist and listens to the authorities. But a poor and hungry man on the other hand, you know, that that is the beginning of when the tables will start turning. So we can always remember, you know, the government's normally

what they do is to ensure there's less resistance, they normally will make sure that their people are well fed, if they're smart. Of course, the topic which we intend to cover today, anyway, is a very vast topic, we will never end it. Here it is, you know, probably a discussion, which is as old as democracy and media themselves, you know, ever since there was a democracy and those media, that that is the struggle. Okay. I'm also looking forward from our speakers on what role does independent media play in keeping the world updated on the political situation? How can we best support suppressed media organizations and individuals, and what is required to refocus international attention on the violence inflicted in countries such as Myanmar, these are things that we will be looking at. And we will also hear from the experts on how some of these recordings were and are being done in countries which not only threatens the media people that actually carry soundtracks. We also hear how media gay media people play the game of hide and seek between life and death in trying to get the stories out there to the people to inform the locals and the world that there is something happening in the country. Despite the danger and fear and threats. We will also find out that the media has the responsibility to keep the stories of resistance on the front pages, and keep them burning in the minds of the people. We definitely look forward to hearing that there are what are the ways we can push the authorities and groups such as ASEAN to ensure that the media gets to perform its duty without being targeted. And while I'm eager to hear from the speakers who are very, very experienced in this topic, I am more eager to hear discussion from the participants as you may have been more hands on and I would like a class where the discussion is to weigh and not just the joining of academic discourse. I hope the class will be as lively as a resistance movement should be. After all, I believe without the media, no resistance movement. be able to take on the form it wants to be. Without the media. That's no way. Okay? Okay. Just keep that. Okay. What is resistance? You know, it is very funny. We see, it is a paradox actually, when we see countries whose governments came into being to the ballot box, and claiming to be practicing democracy, and yet suppress or press the media from reporting the movements of uprising and unhappiness of the people, which actually led to the birth of the concept of democracy. So, the government, that B came into being because of democracy, they allowed the people to vote. But when they came into being, then they started what he called putting their foot down on media reporting any other resistance which might unseat them. So in Southeast Asia, we have 11 countries 10 of which are the Asian ASEAN group, then we have the newest country with the youngest democracy, Timor Leste So of course, you know, Timor Lester have been has been trying to get into ASEAN, but mainly Indonesia and Singapore yet to agree to that. But of course, that is for another discourse, in another master class by itself. And due to the lack of time and study purposes, in this class alone, I would like to look at Indonesia, Timor Leste a, Philippines, Burma and Thailand, which they have a lot of resistance movements of very obvious resistance movements, which make great case studies of struggle of media reporting resistance. When we talk about reporting resistance, I refer to how media struggles to report uprising dissent and unhappiness among the people which then translates to resistance movements and calls for reform, in some cases, even a possible revolution. We haven't had a very big revolution in Southeast Asia yet, but we had many revolutions in Timor Leste that was the one I think was the biggest because they actually broke away. And it is not all political, as Dr. Koh will point out to you later, is not all political. As you know, many of these resistance movements begin due to social economic unhappiness, which then lead lead to uprising against politicians, and then only do they turn into political uprising. I'm sure the speakers will be going into detail to explain the factors which leads to resistance. What we are looking at, would be actually on how far the media reports for the masses and

follow the demands of the citizens, especially in pursuit of desires for change, fight against corruption, and civil education, including for Democratic Change through elections. Excuse me. And we will also look at cases of alternative media, which succeeded in being an important source of information and opinion building and make the traditional media rely on it as new source and it's an important indicator of the people's paths. Excuse me. I'm not really used to talking so much. Reporter usually, it's just asking questions and letting the others talk. You know, Myanmar is perhaps the currently most difficult country in Southeast Asia for media to report on resistance as the Junta does not spare any mercy in ensuring that the media is muzzled. Most recent was the case of us journalists, Danny Fenster, was jailed for 11 years in Myanmar by a military court, the frontier magazine Managing Editor have been accused of just the cough getting to me. Okay. The most recent was the case of us journalist Danny Fenster was jailed for 11 years. In Myanmar by military court. It is, you know, it is appalling that a journalist was tried in a military court. And the this magazine managing editor was accused of a range of offenses, which is quite normal in many in many Southeast Asian countries, including incitement, sedition and terrorism, the only difference is they actually jailed him here. And since the coup by Junta in Burma in Myanmar, the military is also imposed internet blackout shutdown satellite television and crackdown on independent pendant media, revoking the publishing licenses of a number of Myanmar news organizations including Myanmar now. Fenster is currently among some of the 100 journalists, which have been detained since February, and about 30, I think, to remain in jail. And then, in June, we have, you know, two other journalists from the news outlet mizzima and one from the Democratic voice of Burma DVB was jailed. Also under another law is, you know, Colonial Era law, which was revised to make spreading false news of crime. And many of these laws in many of the Southeast Asian countries are the colonial Colonial Era law. In Malaysia, we had the ISP which we did away, but then again, the remnants of it are still in within some other laws. And then, in Thailand, Philippines and Indonesia, the Resistance movements are quite obvious, clear, with movement, masses taking to the streets and being fought off by the authorities, the water cannons and all that. However, the other countries too. We are not saying they're all, you know, peaceful, and there's no resistance movements. The other countries for the poor Malaysian we have silent resistance from the people such as inflation, or because of the prices and inability to vote, for example, in Malaysia when the 18 year olds were allowed to vote, but then, you know, they were not. They would, they were allowed to vote, but they were not allowed to cast their votes as soon as possible. So, having covered politicians, and for more than two decades, I always believe that there are many ways of reporting such resistance, as sometimes the problem is in. In Southeast Asia, we have the big brother watching. So we always, we always have to get creative. No doubt. For example, checking the price of branded clothes. You know, a leader wears is also one way of reporting for on resistance. And many times in Southeast Asian media. For example, in Malaysia, reports of luxurious watches or handbags, or politicians, or politicians, wives, and triggered out cries from the masses that we can even say, a proud to say that the media was the beginning of the movement of resistance. When people read this kind of reports, they start getting angry, they start questioning, and that's when resistance sticks seed among the masses, the same tactics, and this is not something new. Okay, the same tactics were used in the Philippines in 2000. In the 80s, you know, during during the uprising of the people's revolution days, when the media there started reporting about Imelda Marcos, who was well known for a collection of shoes, This then led to the Filipinos forcing them into exile to Hawaii. So it became apparent that she and her husband, Ferdinand Marcos, the president stole billions from the Filipino people, which I believe Dr. Eduardo has,

they have yet to pay back in full. In Indonesia before Suharto was taken down, it was the media which reported the lavish lifestyle and the quality of the people who put it side by side so that people, people judge for themselves. And this led to students on campuses, printing from websites and spreading them on campuses before this fact, the anger of the people against the corrupt government in even though it happened in 1998, at that time, Indonesia was still without internet. It was still without mass Internet, and cheaper, what he called a cheap connection. So at that time, when people did not really have your headphones and stuff, were small websites, printed these things. And then when it got published these things and then the students took it upon themselves to, you know, to print it and and then distribute it. And that is how Suharto was taken down. It started in campuses, and I believe it was also the same for Malaysians, about the same time during the Reformation movement and You know, the thing about Southeast Asia, the virus spreads very fast. And I'm not talking about COVID resistance, when Indonesia has had the resistance movement, then Malaysia felt the heat and decided to do the referencing movement. And the last straw was the sacking of former Deputy Prime Minister Anwar Ibrahim then. And then the funny thing in Malaysia is prior to the 2018 general elections, when one MDV was being discussed, not many people understood what was n one m one M DB was about because it was a massive, massive, massive corruption and theory, which was done very cleverly. So, the same group, which really fought for reformasi resisted, which resisted against Dr. Monitor and brought him down, resisted again, and, you know, brought him up again, to be the seventh Prime Minister. So, you have, you know, this is how the people resist, they resist, not they are not loyal to one politician. So if they see that this politician is correct, or they don't want them, they will resist and even bring back the old one. Okay. Thailand is a bit different from the other sort of resistance movements in Southeast Asia because it's an interesting case study as the rebellion was not only against the elected authorities, but also against the monarchy. Okay. And in Thailand, monarchy is something very, very big. You can lose your life if you go against monarchy because they had the lead last majestic law. So by the end of 2021, we saw leading figures such as you know, these names which might be you know, you must have heard it, I'm a non contact no carretera. Ponce Avenger up and we're all detained and they are awaiting trial in series of detainment and releases somewhere in prison for more than 200 days since 2020. After Minister Prime Minister Prayut chan o Cha, declared to us all loss including last majestic to the oppressors, unless magisters the law when you go against the king, okay, and that is quite easy to use. If you say anything against the king, if you publish against the king, then you are, you know, considered going against the king and this law can even worth a call put you behind bars for life. To recap Thailand, the early 2020 protests were against the government of Prime Minister Prayut chan o Cha, but then later recall that later included demands for reform of the time on it. So first, it started as a as a resistance against the prime minister. And then you know, and then it became the demand for reform of the Thai monarchy. When the monarchy did not the real they realized that the monarchy was in defense of the prime minister. And as in many Southeast Asian countries, again, the university campuses were was the hotbed for the beginning of the resistance. The large demonstration by the free youth umbrella at the democracy mood monument in Bangkok demanded for changes to the Government of Thailand, the dissolution of parliament and intimidation of the people and the drafting of a new constitution. It was it had some of the elements of the Hong Kong Umbrella Movement, which did not really have an overall leader. And this is quite common in Southeast Asian countries. On third August of 2022, student groups publicly raised reform demands demands to reform the monarchy breaking a long time ago of publicly criticizing the monarchy. And a week later 10 demands for

monarchy reform, were declared a 19 September rally saw 20,000 200,000 could have been more and this was regarded as an open challenge to King what a long con. And this normally does not happen in Thailand where they're very, very loyal to the King. And this is many happens to the the media also decided to jump on me they decided that they just have to report Okay, which was not easy for them to do as well. A government decision to delay Voting on the constitutional amendment in late September, fueled nearly unprecedented public Republican statement and mass protests on 14th October, declared a state of emergency in Bangkok, citing what he called alleged blocking of royal motorcade. So then 16 October, we saw the water cannons coming in the first crackdown by police, and you know, those things that we saw on TV, and but it was worth it. They thought it was worth it because even November the Parliament, the parliament, voted to pass two constitutional amendment bills. But then, yeah, content, shut down the protesters demands of abolishing the Senate and recognition of the monarchy. So basically, they pretended that they were going to amend the Constitution. But at the end, they lashed back at the protesters and clashes between the protesters and the police and the royalists. You have a big number of loyalists in Thailand became more prevalent, and the first protests tied in October 2021. Just recently, and with a video showing that he was shot on by law, or with live rounds by a person inside the police station, which actually was very big. Okay, I think next slide. Oh, okay. What is the intimidation, the responses to resistance from the authorities and powers that be come in various forms, it can be subtle, or overt, or plain defensive. Okay, in countries where with the emergency decree, this is the first thing that the governments will reach out when they have lost all control. And they know that they cannot worry call. They cannot win against these protesters. Throughout, usually, responses from the authorities sometimes tend to work on the overkill. And then and that further results in fueling the resistance of forcing the rebellion to go underground. I'll be it for a while. Many a time, although the government's might be tempted to give in, okay, is when you see 1000s of your waters on the streets, they might be tempted to give in Southeast Asian governments usually do not do so at one goal, they might make some amends, given a little bit, but then again, hold back and then use those requests, which the professor said asked for, to entice the masses in the next election to get voted again. So they play this game. And so far, the government responses in Southeast Asia against resistance and resistance reporting would be including, you know, filing criminal charges under the emergency decree. And these emergency decrees most of in most countries are the colonial era law, arbitrary arbitrary detention, police intimidation, or police are very, very used to are not independent in Southeast Asian countries. So they are used very, very freely by the powers that be they delay the tactics to deployment of military information warfare units, we have the cyber troopers and all and then you have the media censorship, which is shutting down the internet shutting down bottles, you know, track the name, we also have that in militia to a certain extent, the mobilization of pro government lawyers groups, which have accused protesters of receiving support from foreign governments or non governmental NGO organizations as part of a global conspiracy. Okay, this is a very western funding is the favorite term to bring back images of communism. And I'm sure malaysiakini has gotten it many times. I'm sure you know, when when you get funded, you know, you you will see, okay, and then the deployment of 1000s of police protests, that is usually done, you know, to show power, okay. And just to recap, once again, the ASEAN countries tend to work very much in the same fashion, when it is trying to put a lid on resistance, why one government may point to another for not listening to their muscles in their own country, the same resistant resistance back in their own country will likely be dealt with the same way. They forget when you point one finger to the other person. The other for what are the

common the this one is pointing back at you. So you know, for example, ASEAN countries have lambasted Myanmar for not condoning human rights on Rohingya. and the need for the agenda to pay to the people firewall, the cases of burn genies and minorities in countries, you know, in Malaysia, and in Brunei, and all this still go on. And when it comes to talking about media censorship, despite many, many engagement, ASEAN leaders shy away, most of the time, and it is not a popular subject, it's not, it's never discussed openly, as all member countries are very well aware that should they talk about it, they might be picked on by the others. So perhaps, they rather you know, just call each other black inside and stay cities. So without, you know, the slight. So these are countries with massive resistance, as I pointed out, with major struggle for media reporting resistance, Myanmar is the most dangerous Philippines, you have big clamp down to the extent of closing down, you know, the ABS network, and then closing down of what he called the portals for, for which the portal founder actually got a Nobel Peace Prize. And then you have Indonesia. And although things seem calm at this time, but Indonesia is actually facing some resistance, because of the promises that joke we made, which might, which they believe that, but But according to Indonesian journalists, they say that it is now not an overt, defense, defensive take that the government is using, but they are using a more subtle, so they have laws, which talk about economy, online and digital things that actually they're trying to crank down the media. So that is what the journalists are saying, so Indonesian government probably has gotten smarter, in how to deal with resistance, then you have Thailand, which is open resistance, and then you have Singapore, which has very, very strict control on his media. But what it is, it is that it is between the lines being reported, there are cases of opposition, but Singapore is a you know, as we all know, it's a it's a tightly controlled, the opposition is still fledgling, despite, you know, the the the advanced that they have made, is rattling. So these are the countries that massive resistance we had, we have, you're not saying that they don't have resistance in other countries, but these are countries which we see, for example, Malaysia, for now, it's the resistance is not very big, but it's in spurts in spurts. You know, when something happens, then people talk about it. But they have yet to take to the streets again, like what we did in recovering the rapid mass movements on the next slide please. So is that all the slides so?

Muhammad Adib Faiz 48:32

Okay. So sorry, there was a slight technical difficulty just now. So, if you'd like to resume from slide 25.

Zakiah Koya 48:42

So, without further ado, I've been on and on. So, let us go to the topic of today, okay, Power to the People, democracy, civil society and resistance in Southeast Asia. A very, very big topic, very, very interesting topic. But, you know, nevertheless, we have to, it has been discussed over and over and over, but we have to keep discussing. So the speakers today are Dr. Dr Khoo Ying Hooi, Dr. Welyne Jeffrey Jehom, and Dr. Eduardo C. Tadem, , and all our experts all are experts on the topic of power to the people and democracy as well as media responsibility. Dr. Khoo will be speaking on understanding protests and movements of resistance? And Dr. Khoo will be highlighting the various forms of protest and movements of resistance, you will realize that the concept of a protest can vary in many ways, and protests can come in the most circles of forms. Okay, Dr. Welyne will be speaking on the art of resistance protests and visual culture in Southeast Asia. This will be very interesting and will prove to be useful to journalists. Because when when you describe the movements of resistance in your stories,

you need to know whether this is actually a resistance and what kind of art is it? You know, you need to explain to the masses, look this there is a resistance happening. This is why you can't if you can't use the word resistance, what what are the forms can you use what are the, because a journalist as far as I believe, is a what they call an artist as well. So, we write it with words, we write it in visual forms, you know, so, this will prove to be very useful for journalists to learn and understand, how the Resistance movements can be made, known and shown and visualized by the masses for the masses. So, if it is just one man standing, you know, emulating himself that is, you know, it is not people might not say that resistance, because this is one man what are called burning itself, but actually it is it is the beginning of resistance. So these are, these are types of resistance, which Dr. Welyne, of course, will go into depth later. And Dr. Eduardo will talk about the Southeast Asian civil society engagement with the ASEAN process challenges and alternatives, he will point out the small sets of achievements which have been made with such engagements, and also the need for a stronger push from all sectors to further engage, and to further push to get the powers that be to listen to the voices of the masses, especially the media. And I'm sure Dr. Eduardo has also, you know, it's taking a lot of effort to get the leaders of the ASEAN to actually listen and hear and talk about the need for media to be given that freedom to report a resistance. And I think I've taken my time, I do

Muhammad Adib Faiz 52:21

no, you still have some time you want to answer some questions, but if you if you prefer to move on to the next presentation, we can do so.

Zakiah Koya 52:29

You know, the the speakers might need more time to discuss I will now hand over to the first speaker. Is Dr Khoo ready?

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 52:48

Yes.

Zakiah Koya 52:49

So I will handle it, hand it over to you. So the floor is yours. Take it away.

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 52:57

Thank you, thank you very much Zakiah, for the keynote presentations and broad views about the resistance in Southeast Asia, especially from the view as a reporter. In my sessions, I'm going to talk about understanding protests and movements of resistance, I must say that I'm very excited to share this topic with all of you here as, as an academic who have the background in the human rights. In the context of Southeast Asia, I must say that this course especially the academic discourse, on social movements, and resistance in Southeast Asia is rather limited. If I look at it from the academic point of views. And from that perspective itself, I think it has impacted on the way that the reports are being returned, and so forth. So those are basically the ideas that I'm going to put forward here. But in my sessions, I'm going to take a step back, as in I will go to a more foundation perspective, foundational perspective in terms of understanding the movements broadly, not only applicable in the context of Southeast Asia, but rather to understand it on the view from I have separate divided my presentation

into four parts. The first part is on the broad views and the concepts, different concepts that we use. Just now, Zakiah mentioned she preferred the use of word resistance. As we see from the reporting different journalists from different countries, they use different terminologies. I see many journalists who cover on Myanmar, they like to use the word pro democracy movement. So there are many different terms that we can use. Nevertheless, some of the terms can be different when we interpret it from the academic view. So my second part of my presentations will go into the theories but of course I wouldn't Talk about this solely from the academic view. But the theory is the evolution of the social movement theory is very interesting in which it actually tells us what are the elements that are being covered in the media, and how this can actually generate news story ideas, and so forth from the theoretical point of views. And my third part will be on the stages of social movements. Because, see, there's a lot of reporting that they normally started to report about the movements when the protests in the streets happen. But it is not way before when there's has been some grievances and things like that. But of course, from the other side, they are obstacles that the journalists face as well, and the resources and things like that. But however, social movement does have its own process and things. And my force, before I conclude, I will be providing just a very brief views about the media reporting, and of course, talk about the biasness, and so forth, and how it can actually impact on these social movements progress in Southeast Asia. So from the very much historical perspectives here, the global views, I did my thesis on electoral reform movement, Bersih. So when I was doing my PhD on Bersih at that time, I must say that he has been rather challenging to find social movement scholars in the Southeast Asia, we do have however, they are rather limited literature's that are being available. And hence, a lot of literature's are very much on from the Western scholarships were from the global point of views that this the rise of the democratic representation, especially in the US and the England, in the late 70s, where the social movements are basically highly associated with democratic societies. Hence, when we put in the context of Southeast Asia, we know, there are many countries who remains to be known democratics, authoritarian, and so forth. So there has been a lot of discussions and debates on how do we then use the Western scholarship to be applied into the context of Southeast Asia alone. So however, the social movements studies evolved in the late 19th and 20th centuries, whereby there has been more dynamic interaction between the democratic societies and the process of democratization. And in authoritarian societies as well. So when we're talking about a lot of resistance movements that Zakiah was mentioning just now, is all about the process of democratization, even in the context of Malaysia as well. So my view here and some scholars is that social movements plays a huge part in terms of the process of democratization. But we understand that from Malaysia and many other parts of Southeast Asia, protests or movements always being seen in a negative perception as in something that is rather negative, but not looking at it from the view that it can actually contribute to the social and political change. So in the mid 1970s, there's a lot of research on collective actions coming from the emotional and psychological approach. So this is one part of the things that is missing in a lot of the reporting here, because a lot of reports focus on the political actors, the institution's no systems, rather, in fact, when we talk about social movements in the resistance, there's a lot of elements coming from the emotions and the psychological approach, as in coming from the discipline of political psychology to understand why do people protest? What are the factors that the movements actually occur? And what are the impacts? So those are the things from the global view. So from the regional perspective, of course, a one of the main challenges that are always come about is the heterogeneous identities and the diverse historical and geopolitical circumstances in Southeast Asia. I think this does not only put,

challenge the challenges in terms of the academic literature, but it also put a lot of challenges when it comes to the reporting. So there are many reporting that focus only on country context. Rather, if we want to put it in, in a more regional context, it can be a little bit more challenging. So there is a need to actually look at many different elements that come about when we understand the social movements. So just now Zakiah has mentioned about, you know, some of the previous resistance struggles in different countries, I think, late 1990s. We saw some of the fall of authoritarian regimes and then of course, the waves of Arab Spring and then Occupy Wall Street basically Renu the developments from small scale mobilizations to mass movements somehow, in the academic literature, and in terms of we can see more reporting on the protests and movements as well. So if somehow becomes part of the political process and being normalized, because one of the factors is the emergence of the opposition forces and civil society, I think one of the countries that remains to be under reported is Cambodia, which is in one of the countries that requires a lot of media attention in in examining what is really happens in Cambodia, apart from we're talking about Myanmar, Philippines, Thailand, Indonesia, and other countries. So, so they are similar levels, but different styles of the state repression that I see from all the Southeast Asian countries. If we look at Singapore, it is at a different levels where it's a huge economic growth there. However, when we talk about democracy, there's really a lot of things that we want to talk about resistance and the hindrances and the legislations as well. So, moving forward on the different concepts, I think, there are many different concepts we can use some we use social movement, basically, social movements refers to a loose network of people who share the same grievances and engage into the collective actions. But there are also terminology that we call social movement organization, in fact, for per se, it is considered as an organization's because it is being institutionalized. So, however, of course, in the media, this term is hardly being used as well. So political movements, some there are more in in pushing for political change. protest movement is quite popularly being used as well, or resistance movements. revolutionary movements basically refer to movements that attempt to overthrow government, civil disobedience is being used very frequently to describe Myanmar movements, civil disobedience movements. And civil resistance concept is basically referred to nonviolent resistance. So I think there's these things between violent versus non violent resistance that we talk about. So from the academic view, terminology, civil resistant, basically refer to the non violence. So for the civil society is another concept that many recordings are being used. But however, civil society is extremely broad, civil society actors, sometimes it is being misused, because it's basically send out different messages to people when you just put everything as civil society. So NGOs are part of it were some, the time to use just NGOs to describe the movements and movements describe it as an NGO, also, there are many actually different terms that should be used and should be carefully being within as well. So I will just like to focus a little bit more about this social movement concept by Charles Tilly, a prominent scholars in the social movement studies by focusing on the worthiness, Unity numbers, and the commitments that he used here. So very interestingly, the W and C that child's theory has been put forward is that those are the things that actually media has been reporting about. Nevertheless, it is not really being put together in a in a more comprehensive reporting, because sometimes I see the issues is that when we go for different commentators, they might have their own biasness. So when you go for politicians or political commentators, they might not look at movements from the movement point of view, they will always tie movement together with politics, but it's not everything should be politicized. They are more things to talk about the movement. So w NCS is very useful, whereby when we talk about worthiness, basically, it's referring to the component that is

most directly related to how protests actually behave while protesting. So worthiness here is really referring to the non violent behaviors, that the movements to like to show that he's no movements that actually when we talk about social movements that will like to engage into the violent approach first. So the second one is the unity I think the Unity component is always being put up by the media reporting, of course. So basically, Unity refers to the agreement among the protesters. So Unity does not actually deal with the substantive message, the protest broadcast, but it deals with the extent to which how the media is shared among the participants. So for instance, the question of Do they really have a common claim shared by all so unity can most of the time not be observed directly, so it can occur in the head of the protester. So that's why very often we see protests that typically attempt to evoke their use visually and behaviorally. So numbers, I think numbers is something that all the media are very familiar with the how many actually go down on the street, and how many likes or Twitter's or how many tweets and things like that. And we know we always know that the numbers can be very, very different. However, this is really, really challenging. Actually, when you put up a number that doesn't really represent the div, it really can impose a lot of impacts to the protesters. So the numbers ice is one thing that I think media should pay a little bit more, a little bit more careful in, in reporting when it comes to numbers. So and then the commitment, of course, the appeal or track generated by a movement really also depends on the degree of the commitment, the protests that is displayed. But of course, movements relies on media a lot, and very often. Coming in from the media lens, I know there are challenges that the media and the reporters have to face. However, when the message of the movement is not being put up in a way that the goal is supposed to achieve, it can actually impact on that movement itself, for instance, by take per se, per se is also is only known as useful if they go down on the street, whereby their original goal is not go on the street, but people have associated with the image on the media that per se is yellow, and it is street protests. So I believe that is a huge challenge imposed to per se, in terms of you know, they actually wanted to do voters education. So those are the things that however, it has been more than a decade, because it has been and has to suffer with that kind of image. So it actually put a lot of impacts on Brazil in terms of sustainability. And the another point that is not being pointed out by Tillys, but by other scholars is about diversity. So when it comes to the diversities here, is really applicable in the context of Southeast Asia. Because sometimes when the media reporting also we have to show nowadays, I think a lot of media has put up the use part of the protest movements and things. But really, it is not really only the use sometimes in some of the protests, but it is a mixture of the different groups as well. So sometimes the diversity itself is also very important to show and to create awareness about the certain forms of the protests. So social movements, I will move a little bit to the social movements theories here, basically, what I have highlighted just now as well, that it is an interdisciplinary studies. Hence I, the point I would like to really put up is that it is not just about political science, looking at scientists looking at social movement, but really from the political psychology views as well. And so for that we I hope that this this can reflect in the media reportings a little bit more in the context of Southeast Asia. So the evolution of social movement theory is very similar with what I have mentioned about, in fact, we talk about resources. Yeah, so we know some movements, they have existing resources, but some, I think a lot of movements in in the context of Southeast Asia, they do not have much resources, and one of the resources is actually media. Media is everywhere. And media is extremely powerful. When we talk about movements about they can either they can they can really impact heavily on the movement on the movements and how it is being progressed, whether it can actually achieve the goals or it is it doesn't. So the political process theory is the one that I'm going to

focus here and this is the theories that actually I use in describing the developments and the formations of the policy here. So resource mobilization theories basically is not something that most of the movements in Southeast Asia has because it not only refer to the financial resources, but of course, it also focuses on the media resources and so forth as well. And and the media as we know, the challenges in the context of Southeast Asia where some are state owned, some are party own and some can be not independent. So those are the things that the most of the movements in Southeast Asia do not have the luxury with that is to have a more independent reporting about the goals. So but resource mobilization story basically telling that the actions of the members and participants are rational. I think this is one of the challenge that you know when of course me During the reporting, it is in a way that it is a platform to create awareness, as well. So very often public see, participants are irrational. But from the social movement studies view, the participants in the protester are all being recognized as rational actors. But of course, it can open up to a little bit more debates. So political process theory is basically looking at how the external opportunities can actually help the movements to grow. So this is one of the things that a lot of reporting, I actually focusing on that however, what I would really like to show is here, the political opportunity structures derived from the political process theory from that, Adam, in which he divided into this theory into four. So if you look at popular access to the political system, division within the elite, the availability of allies and the state repression, all of this somehow have been regularly being reported by the media in different reporting, sticking pieces by pieces. You know, I think one of the things that being very often being reported is the elements on the state repression. So you we know, state repression can affect the mobilization, which, whereby mobilization is one of the key things that social movements have to survive on how they can mobilize the people, the availability of allies, look into different allies, one of the allies is a political party. Another ally says can be media. So I will skip the media, as we already know, but political parties, this is where it becomes issues in some of the countries because if the movement is close to the opposition political party, which most of the time in the context of Southeast Asia share the same grievances, then they will be talking about, you know, the movements are no longer independent. But from the social movement studies point of view, that is totally accepted up to the different political context, because if we look at past histories, a lot of independence movement resistance movement actually turned into a political parties. So those are the things that I think in, in more public discourse has been missing out. Popular access to the political systems, of course, refer to the movements do not have the regular access to the political powers, hence, we have the social movements. So I think some times the media also reporting on this, however, is not really being that in depth, and the divisions within the elites basically refers to the fragmentations that happened with the political elites, either some of the high profile politicians or some of the different class privilege classes or the people or middle class, upper class that actually joined into the movements that can actually provide opportunities to the movements to grow. So basically, the POS political opportunity structures can constrain or expand the collective action in many, many ways, I think I will just like to want to focus is that they can actually create opportunities for the opponents, I think, in the case of Malaysia, we see the rich. So, when you have a lot of media reporting on the per se in one point, I mean, from the social movement studies point of view, it shows that Bersih movement has successfully actually penetrate into the society, hence you have the backfire. Hence, you have the counter movements like race shirt. So of course, opportunities like this can be used in both way. My third part of it stages of movement. So very often law reportings happens in the second stage, on the coalescence stage in which when the movements are already managed to actually get a

lot of discontent this content or frustrations coming from the different populations and the leadership has emerged somehow and the strategies of success are being mapping out. So in the emergence is basically just a widespread discontent. So there are many recordings, of course, to say that, you know, there have been people not happy with the economic policies in the countries and so forth. However, I think what what is really lacking is perhaps a more reporting SEC can that a follow up reporting to the discontent or grievances that happens in that countries? So to follow the story a little bit and provide a more comprehensive reporting? So under stage three of the reporting is basically bureaucratize is the institutionalization of the social movements whereby it is being used characterized by the high levels of organizations and the collision based strategies, I think collision based strategies is something that Brasil is doing. And it comes about from the limited resources that the most of the movements have, and at the stage where they are bureaucrat ising, they can, they can no longer just rely on a mass rallies or any leaders to progress towards their goals. So, those are the moving to the third stage. And the first stage decline, decline stage can be divided into five different paces. So success means that you know, the movement basically has managed to achieve the goals failure normally happens when they are faced with a lot of state repression, very high state repression. Quotations happened, where some organizations or movements can be highly dependent on centralized authority or charismatic leadership. So when the movement leaders come to associate with the authorities, the leader could be, you know, being co opted into the systems and that can contribute to the decline of the movement itself. And another one is the repressions whereby the authorities are the agents acting on behalf of the authorities use the measure, sometimes violent to actually control or destroy a movement. And the last one go mainstream, basically, meaning that the goals or ideologies are adopted by the mainstream it which this is hardly happen in the context of Southeast Asia. But this is basically the stages of social movements that I would like to share. And now I go to my very last part and the concluding quickly, and mediating message supporters Now I mentioned media is really, really important. When we talk about social movements, so activists, of course, they need the media to convey a message to wider audiences. However, we are always talking about this framing issues, how the media frame that movements, ideas, ideologies, and the goals are very, very important as it can directly impact on the process of developments of that particular social movement itself. So media coverage can help marginalize actor several social and political agenda. But how often does it help. And I think some in some of the instances, it can actually create some backfire as well, depending on how the media is reporting on that. But basically, if we put it in the lens of the activist movement must frame injustice to convince as wide an audience as possible that the problem exists and the collective efforts at redress are efficacious. So the biasness in reporting, I think, is something that the generally space dilemma with, there are different types of biasness one selective selection bias, which protests get covered, most of the protests that get covered and a big, big protest, there are many protests, or protest, when I say protest, it doesn't mean on the street protests. But many movements are not being covered, unfortunately, yeah, depending on the issues. So nowadays, a lot of things are talking about environments, climate change. So most of the focus are all gone to anything to do with environments. So other kinds of movements that fight for other rights can be actually marginalized in such a way. So those are the things that can impact on a movement description bias, how is protests being described is extremely important. It can actually kill a movement itself by putting the different narratives on that movements. So explaining biasness. Of course, this is basically focusing on organizational factors, structural factors and ideological factors. I think this is very common dilemma for many journalists hear

that. And one thing is that journalists can be generalists as well, because you can't expect a journalist must be trained in a social movement studies to cover on social honor movements. So that takes a lot of research and so forth. But sometimes that can actually impact on how the reporting is being done, and can impact on the development of the movement, structural factors. This is something that a lot of media's are facing advertising avenues, and what kind of report that you should do and things like that ideological factors. And sometimes perhaps the personal bias coming from the journalist can also impact on how the movement is being framed in the media as well. So in the conclusion, I would just like to put up a few ideas and the suggestions here I think interdisciplinary reporting is really important, as in looking at movements from a different lens. Not only always start out with the state actors, but perhaps There's a lot of stories and narratives that looking at the protesters. But sometimes it is very much selective only on this, several faces. So I think those are the things changes in public policy. That means to tie the movements, with the changes in the public policy, that means any form of political change, for instance, per se, and electoral reforms. So those are some of the things that have been being reported, quite successfully, in a way, social movements and democratization. So this is basically, even in globally there have been growing literature's in terms of linking movements and the democratic nations because democratization is a process where there's a lot of focus on the state actors, there's little focus on movements, or even in a broader way the civil society, how they can contribute to the process of democratization. So this is one of the things and I'll let you put up here. And my final point is that protest is not all just marching in the street protests can be many, many other forms as well. I say this, because this is the very first challenge that I faced when I introduced the course on social movements and democratization in the University of Malaya. My first class of the students, basically, they think, is going to teach me about how to go to the street to protest when they see the word movements. So there's a lot of negative perceptions in terms of protest. So protests can be in any form, it doesn't need to be just on the street. So and that tied up with how we view the concept of movements and the resistance as well. Thank you very much.

Zakiah Koya 1:21:52

Thank you, Dr Khoo Ying Hooi, . Okay. I'm sorry, I did I rushed into you, without introducing for everyone said, what he called Knowledge. Dr Khoo Ying Hooi, is a senior lecturer at the Department of international strategic studies University Malaya and she is what he call teaching at the Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences in University Malaya. She is also the editor in chief of the Malaysian Journal of International Relations. And she sits in the editorial board on the editorial board of the Journal of current Southeast Asian affairs, Journal of Southeast Asian human rights, and Indonesian Law Review, I L. R, Ev, she has been active in the works related to human rights and democracy in the Southeast Asian region for more than a decade. And it's very much consulted by NGOs, and even to some extent the government bodies who are interested to find out what exactly, you know how exactly to deal with resistance movements. She's very well versed, we have a one question from Thailand, what do you want to take that first Doctor Khoo

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 1:23:15

Yeah, so I can thank you Zakiah. So basically, I think return upon us about the the word non violent and violent resistance movements, basically, when we understand movements from social movements from the perspective of social movement studies, social movements, is as a movement that engage into the

non violent approach. So we do not talk about the violent approach. So But however, there are movements that are using the violent approach, even we talk about Hitler, he started this this political parties from a movement. So those are the violent approach, as in how I define the violence and non violence is basically non violent means you're not using any forms of violence in terms of weapons, in terms of hurting another person's and so for basically, you go for the approach of engaging in terms of because I think in the context of Southeast Asia, what's missing is that the the role of police the role of authorities, when we talk about the role of authorities, many people have the perception that the police is a is on the ground to actually stop the protests in which that is not the role of the police. They should be the one who facilitate I think that is the one that is missing here, when we talk about the role of the police here so police roles and authorities should facilitate the protesters on the street to make sure it is peaceful. So when we talk about non violent basically is the through peaceful means and violence is through a non peaceful means. Thank you very much.

Zakiah Koya 1:24:59

Thank you, Doctor Khoo. it was interesting when you mentioned about the numbers, you know, we we have this problem when, as reporters, we are out reporting on the ground, you see, you're amongst the people, but you don't, you can't really count the numbers. So I think Malaysian reporters found a way of doing what he called the struggle with that during the reformasi movements, because the government is saying one thing the police is saying one thing the organizers are claiming millions, you know, it can range from 10 to millions. So, and then you will have what he called photographs being put out because of the advances in what he called the the technology, you know, one will show this 1000 people and then another picture will show there's like 10,000 people, and the smart ones will dissect the photo and then find out that it all this is cut and paste and all that. So, media gets into a bind over that. So, it is interesting, you know, if if there is a way of calculating how many people are in one group, I think there are ways which I think we regarded, we tried to do in Malaysiakini, we actually, you know, counted people to a certain extent and then, you know, tile them up, you know, 50 here, 5050 here, that kind of thing. So, but that that is a struggle, that is a struggle, what does media do, when they are faced with that the organizers are claiming 10 million people are marching. While on a call, the government says no, it was only 100 people. So would you want to answer that.

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 1:27:04

Yeah, I acknowledged that challenge. And I must say, I do not have solutions for that. Hence, that's why I mentioned about this WUNC perhaps the reporting can add on with that the Wow, from the from academic writing, we normally say that, you know, there are different numbers that giving given by different parties. However, we should look at the other factors such as the commitments and the worthiness and you know, unity from the people but I'm not sure whether this can be done in the media reporting, but that's how we do that in the academic way.

Zakiah Koya 1:27:46

Yeah. So numbers in the eye of the beholder. So, okay, we will take a short break. 10 minutes break. It is now 15 It is now four o'clock. So we come back at 410. And after that, we will hear from Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom, So 10 minutes break for Everyone. Hello everyone oh we all here Okay, can you hear me okay, so we move on. Our next speaker is a Dr Welyne Let me get name correct it's Okay, tDr

Welyne Jeffrey Jehom, I hope I've said it correctly. He's a senior lecturer, Department of anthropology and sociology, also from University Malaya. Okay. And she's with the Faculty of Arts and Social Science and she's, as she has been with University Malaya since 2009. She is also the she was also the head of Center for Indigenous Studies from 2018 till June to 2021. And her research interests focuses on community driven development that includes the development of indigenous knowledge for community livelihood and women empowerment. She's quite well sought after by the media for for knowledge on indigenous issues, and to share indigenous new knowledge from research with the wider public. She has curated cultural religious heritage exhibitions for educational purposes, highlighting the digital policy sensory exhibition concept, and their sex has activated both in the country and internationally between 2015 to 2018. She works very closely with the communities partner in her research through various engagements, including establishing community enterprise with the community performance research interest is currently on the fostering of the local approach in the conservation of indigenous knowledge. She's currently completing her book on Eban Khumbu weaving for a sustainable community development. I am not sure if Dr Welyne are you from Sarawak. Okay, so Iban as well. No. Okay. All right. Dr. Welyne. I will, we'll be talking about the art of resistance protest and visual culture in Southeast Asia. From the hearts of Borneo itself. Please call with a call to start. You can unmute your mic. I think you have already. Okay.

Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom 1:42:10

Yes, yes. Thank you, Zakia. And thank you. SEAFOR to invite me to give this sharing, I wouldn't call it lecture, I will call it sharing, because I think I'm going to take a different approach to discuss the art of resistance. And first, I will actually would like to share. What I'm going to discuss here is what is art activism. And then I will look into the diplomatic and democratic way of protests by highlighting James Scott work. There are two important books. Yeah. I will show you later. And then I'm going to zoom in into indigenous rights, culture and protest movements. We were speaking about non violent movement, non violent protests. So I will be focusing on that. And I'm not going to go into a lot of topics, but discussing the previous work that can be taken as examples in way to innovate to protests. And then it also in a way to take sources for reporting. Yeah. And then I will just speak about the work of the Orang Asli how they actually start this very slow, but very effective movement. Silently, no. Sometimes the protests, but the way of protesting is very visual on art activism. Okay. Next, sorry, no, I have to send that. Okay, um, I purposely put here like I, I would just would like to share with you what art is all about. You don't like, I am very sure that you know what art is all about. But we also have to know that art has power. Yeah, I'm just going to repeat here. So impactful art has the power to do more than just grab the audience's attention. And that's the whole reason why we have paintings we have very powerful visual documentaries, we have photos, we have new roles, we have monuments, we also have we have dimension mirror already also certain kind of assembles that has been put out in order to convey the message. Yeah. So most of these kinds of things like assemble have stuff like trees, or branches or bottles, whatever, can be find all over the world, but we just don't pay attention to it. Okay, so it can send global messages of statement and solidarity. Yeah. So two important thing here is messages of statement and solidarity resonating with people around the world. Yeah, the intersection of art activism has always existed. So through protests, or to share messages of hope, or through graffiti on street art. Yeah, we don't really see much gravity in Column four. But if you go to Europe, I think the most gravity that I have ever seen in my life through my travels to Europe is in Eastern Europe, they actually

dedicate the whole wall outside of the city, just for gravity. And they are so interesting to look at, I provide you here, the website that I have taken this segment next. Okay, so here is the meaning of activism. Yeah. So, I will not use the word resistance, I will not use the words protests, but I will use the word activism. And I will tell you why I prefer activism rather than protest. And also resistance is not only because it is a kind of non violent movement, but it's also very, very capturing in so many different ways. So activism is always about the challenge of changing power relations. So there are countless ways of engaging in activism, and being an activist. But the goal of activism is action in order to create an effect, of course, protests and also resistance, it has greater impact, because it's, it's real, it's, it's out there. And, and you can be directly involved with it. And journalists can actually be directly involved, and also to report what's going on there. And then yeah, but it's different with art and activism. So art, on the other hand, is quite broad. So it's very hard to describe, like, in terms of many physical and emotional forms, if I would compare art activism to the street protests, I would feel very emotional in then and there when I join a protests, but without activism, it's going on the whole time, you know. So the goal of Art has always been to evoke a certain meaning of feeling by the viewer or participant, it makes you think it much longer time. It, it lets you to solve the solve what you see you interpret, it might be the same interpretation as the others, but at least there is a kind of accumulative interpretations that basically journalists can come and ask each one of these people, what do they think about the way a certain event has been? has been portrayed or presented. Okay, so it combines the creative skills of arts to emotionally connect us to a form of activism, where the goal is some sort of social change. So because he was speaking about emotion, and also psychology, of course, during protests on the street, we have the kind of blood pumping emotions and all these kind of things. In my younger days, I used to join blockades with the banal I was in my first year second year, so it was deep in the forest. There's no journalists, okay, so all we could do is to defend what we believe needs to be defended. I remember it was in 19. Slow, long time ago 1992 during semester break, it was in Oulu, barang in Sarawak, and a group of nantinya and also the Cayenne people. They wanted to go against this group of loggers, one of the first group of loggers I don't want to mention the name here, but everybody knows. So we actually erected human barrier. It's so hot pumping. It's like, you know, it's it's if it's kind of when you do bungee jumping or you jump from the plane. I don't know if any one of you has done that, you know, that kind of adrenaline that you have an anything can happen anytime. You see the bulldozers are coming. You know, like, it was my first time the Pernod looks really cool. They just do their hands like that. But I was like, Okay, is it going to stop in front of me, you know, that kind of feeling. So it's really scary. And that's the whole reason why that was my first and the last. And I would prefer just the one who take pictures and also to help my friend who is a journalist to write about it. Yeah. And I just do behind the scenes kind of things, but it's really scary. And, and to be honest, I have not joined any percent movement, because I'm just scared. I'm just scared but I do something else. It doesn't mean that I'm not supporting activism, but I'm doing something else other than just go to the street. Okay. Thanks. Okay. I would like to acknowledge Professor Farhad Alatus, because yesterday he was giving a seminar on theory and literature review. So he put up this two paintings here. So I put it under interpretations because he was talking about theory, but what I would like to highlight here is that how an event has been interpreted differently. I will explain to you why I did that. Okay, so the first one is the Hang on, I just want to look for my note because I don't really remember the whole story. Okay, so it is actually the earliest portrayal of art activism, I would call it interpreting events to show our elections and story from the other side. This painting is actually about deep Undergaro in the first pendant is a tongue

Iran deepened. Oh, girl. Yeah, I descended also tons of Yogyakarta was passed over several times for ascension to the throne. So in 1825, after declaring himself a rat to Adele, and his enemies infidels for their legs practice of Islam, he began a war against the reigning of Sudan and the Dutch colonial government. So in the five year struggle that followed, which was waged over much of Central Java, yeah. Over 200,000, Javanese and 15,000 Dutch soldiers were killed. So on March 28 1830, yeah, with most other guerrilla leaders captured the panagora was invited to come to Lieutenant General the courts have in my guilty negotiate and to end the hostilities and guaranteed passive safety of the passage, but after three hours, he was arrested, he was exiled to Makasar, Sulawesi, where he remained until his death. Okay, so the first painting it was from reading Sale, and Sale depiction is not the only painted version of the panagora Scripture. You have the second painting. It was by a Dutch painter called Nicholas pinjaman. Yeah, so the earlier version by the Dutch painter, yeah. It was completed in 1835. And it shows rather than an angry defiant men pin a man presented a submissive and beaten Diponegoro Okay, standing lower than his captor and symbolically symbolically having less power. Okay. So, but if you look at the other picture, the other painting? Yeah, it is totally different. prints, the porter Goro stands the field in front of that Dutchmen. You're in front of the colonias officers mentioned. So he appears to be struggling to control his anger, as would be expected from Java this Gentry. Yeah. And if you look at the face of the Dutchman, his eyes are static and avoid the eyes of the others. Okay, so these are different interpretations of two different scenes. So I guess it would apply in journalism as well. They don't like each each journalists will report different things, but what most important is is what you are going to report you know, are you going to just observe or are you going to speak to the people who are really involved in that situation? So Okay, move on. Okay, so these are the interesting website that you can actually look at activism and also the history of activism, which I will not share, but you can just click on this And then you can do follow later. Next. Okay, so now I just want to share with you before I share this one I would like to bring your attention to an event happened in France a few years ago, if you remember, sometimes in November 2011, the newspaper office in the way in the 20th, around this mall in Paris was fire bomb and its website was hacked. Okay, does anyone recall that? The attacks are presumed to be linked to a decision to rename the addition of the third November 2011 ceria. Abdo if you recognize the name, Charlie Hebdo. Yeah, okay. It's it's a very historical event for France because it is something related to the freedom of speech. Yeah. And I do believe that in our country. We do not have that such opportunity and privilege. Okay, so in that situation, yeah. ceria Abdo with Mohammed listed as the editor in chief. Okay, so the cover featuring a cartoon of Mohammed saying 100 lectures of the week if you don't die laughing Yeah. It sounds funny. It's very, it's very, like, direct. If you are a French person, you would just love. I was in France when that happened. I wasn't laughing because I know. It's going to touch the very core of the Muslim people. Especially the extremist. Yeah. Okay. So, and because of that, yeah, a lot of things have happened, but the Chania though issued has been a respond to a recent post election introduction of Sharia law in Libya, and the victory of the Islamic party in Tunisia. Okay, so basically it was just trying to convey the message about the oppressions of woman under Sharia taking aim at domestic violence mandatory veiling Bearcats, restriction of freedom, forced marriage stoning of those accused of adultery, and so on. So on, so on, including polygamy, flogging, stoning gays and lesbians, forced marriage, and a lot of other things, even though the message was very clear, but because it's a bit satirical, it stirs up the whole world of Islamic world. Yeah. So of course, it ended up in bombing and everything. And then in 2015, for example, they were making fun of, I can't say they were making fun, because the message is

really to give awareness and also to, to speak about something that other people might not want to speak about, you know, so. And because of that, they were shooting bombing. And, and then finally, some of them died. Yeah. So the website, Charlie Hebdo, went offline shortly after the shooting. And when it returned, it bought the ledger just sweet Charlie, meaning that I am Charlie. So I also had the t shirt. I am Charlie to see Charlie. So everybody who actually on the side of, of this event, they all were just ritually on certain days. Yeah. Okay. So now back to Malaysia, we have zunar. What happened is how many times zunar get arrested being called to the police station. And his cartoon is not even as aggressive as satirical Charlie Hebdo. So that is how much freedom of speech, non freedom of speech that we have in Malaysia. Okay. And just recently, again, he was he was called by the cadastre. Government, because he did a cartoon, which lampooned the cadastre government's decision to cancel the type of some public holiday, which was published on Facebook on January 23. Yeah, I think it was important by a militia kindy journalists cogently. Yeah, yeah, actually, Malaysia Kenya is my favourite news. I will subscribe because I feel that you can only find the real news on malaysiakini. I mean, no, no hard feelings for other media. But I do feel that this is the best platform. And the other one is our report. And of course, you know what happened to Serravalle report with Mrs. Brown's stories and cases you know, So, and there's another type of activism, which I like very much is through freedom film phase, which is also in Malaysia. And the most powerful one, which I still remember until today was the one from Agnes Padden. If you remember, if you did attend that it was speaking, speaking about, you know, her determination to ensure that rural communities in Sarawak to have the right to proper health care and equal access to amenities. I mean, just imagine in this in this century, we do still have people in our who die because of childbirth. Why? Because there's no access to health care. There's no access to, to hospitals to clinics, it's too far, you know, even if you have a clinic nearby, but there's only normal people. It's just a dresser. We call it stuff. And every time you get sick, whether you have stomach ache, headache, or diarrhea, whatever, they only prescribe you Panadol. Yeah, so she was trying to advocate this. And I'm surprised that journalists did not do detail interview with her about the real situations happening in Sarah. So it was a bit disappointing, but it was good to watch the documentary. Yeah. Okay. Can we look at slide six? This is like six. Okay, sorry. Go back to Jim Scott. The previous slide. No, the previous slide. Yes, of resistance. So Maria dB, so confused. Okay, so we go to add resistance, Jim Scott. Okay. So I had liked the quote I have from Jim Scott is said most of the political life of subordinate groups is to be found neither in the overt collective defiance of power holders, no incomplete hegemonic compliance, but in the vast territory between these two polar opposites, okay. Jim Scott is my favorite author. I read both books. I was forced to read this books when I did anthropology and you can, but I found it really good that I read it again and again. Why? Because he, he basically he studies the effects of green revolution in rural Malaysia. So one of the main objectives of the study is to make an argument that the Marxian and Gramscian ideas of false consciousness and hegemony are incorrect. Okay, so why do I, I highlight weapons of the week. So activism occurs in everyday life and art act is preserved is the political life and movement of the subordinate groups. And Jeff's got basically speak about the wrong asleep. Yeah. And there's the whole reason why I chose the case study over an athlete today. So, as Jim Scott not yes, he said that, he he basically provides a data perspective on hegemony and invisible power, that has been both influential and also controversial. So, in his book, weapons of the weak everyday forms of resistance, he basically introduced the idea that oppression and resistance are in constant flux, and that by focusing on visible historic events, such as organized rebellions or collective action, we can easily miss subtle but powerful

forms of everyday resistance. So being a journalist, maybe you can relate to what I was saying. Yeah. So he, he basically look at the peasant and slave societies and deal ways of responding to domination. Okay, so imagine the Orang Asli land rights issues with state government. Okay. So he, he basically look at how do you call that he focused not on observable x, which is very obvious, right? We always report on the very obvious, observable acts, but he insisted that if you would really like to see how nonviolent resistance take place, you have to observe the non observable acts of rebellion. Yeah. unformed forms of cultural resistance and non cooperation that are employed over time through the course of persistence of YouTube. So, reporting is not just about I'm not a journalist, I'm not a reporter, but it is based on research experience, you cannot make a conclusion or to write something just then and there. You know, it's, it's always like, you need to go back again and again and again. I mean, at least that's what I do when I do my sake. So, however, what interests me more is what he studied the actions that the indigenous people studied. So, his research finds that over peasant Rebellions are actually rather uncommon. So, it it does not occur when and where expected and often don't have much impact rather than seeing resistance as organization, he actually look at less visible everyday forms of resistance such as foot dragging, evasion, false compliance, pilfering, feign ignorance, slander and sabotage, yeah. So, he finds this in rural and factory settings, and also among the middle class and elite for example, especially with through tax evasion or prescriptions, but particularly among the rural people who are physically dispersed and less political organized than urban populations. So, and he also look at closely linked to the idea of resistance, where he his notion of transcript hidden and public which establish ways of behaving and speaking that fit particular actors in particular social settings, whether Dominion or press, yeah, so therefore, what he says was resistant is a subtle form of contesting public transcript by making use of prescribed roles and language to resist the abuse of power, including things like rumor, gossip, disguise, linguistic tricks, metaphor, euphemisms, folktales, ritual gesture and enmity. Yeah, so, you can actually find that on page 137, if you read the book. So, this methods are particularly effective in situations where violence is used to maintain the status quo, allowing avail discourse of dignity and self assertion within the public trans public transcripts. So, in which ideological resistance is disguise, muted and well for safety sake, so non violent safety, everybody can go home peacefully. So these forms of resistance require little coordination or planning. Yeah, and are used by both individuals and groups to resist without directly confronting or challenging elite norms. Okay, so this is really, really important when when one would like to look at the the resistance or activism of indigenous people in Malaysia, particularly the Orang Asli, and also the Penang and now come to Kenya and Kenya, the urban topic about land rights, how the land has been taken by all man, for example. Okay, next. Now, I'm going to zoom in into a more specific topic where our activism has been used effectively to, to convey the message of the oral athlete to various state government. Okay. Before that, I would just like to bring your attention to a few situations of the athlete Malaysia, in case some of you do not know. So Orang Asli is a legal term and the act 134 that address more than more than 39 different groups. Yeah, specifically, there's a three different big groups of Orang Asli as Orang Asli. So you don't actually translate the term Orang Asli to indigenous people, because the term itself is a legal term, it's DNA. Okay, so it means just the, the original people, yeah. So Orang Asli, they have resist, they have protests. They're involved Bersih they have put up barrier blockades at the borders of the land with satellite they have the social movement as well like jeringan kampung jetting and compound Orang Asli. Malaysia, which is actually founded by an oral Asli woman called Pija. So they have done a lot of things but a lot of things that they have done silent, they don't

really put it out there in order for the public to know. Okay, so these are very interesting things that should be published because it's something that without the motivations of strong, powerful NGOs or individuals, you know, it's really coming from the community itself. What lacking in our Malaysian journalism is that the community voice is very small. We always in the report that I read, yeah, there's a lot of news that I, I read news every day, including, including Malaysia kitty as well, sometimes it's just highlighting the events. But there is no community voice, there's no visible community voice to really speak about the situation. It does not engage emotionally. It's like, when you read the news, you just read the news, and then tomorrow, you forget, you know, it does not leave that kind of impact. I would really like to read a news about certain events that made me tear up or make me wouldn't be able to sleep at night. So, that is the kind of journalism that is not yet there in our country. I feel, I mean, this is just my criticism, I hope, I hope no hard feelings here. Okay. So, there are a few situations that are actually facing like, it has been reported that they are actually like, they are asked the community who live in Bhutan, simpan Kalanga, utara forest reserve, for example, just recently they were they were traveled there 250 individuals from 12 different villages actually went to see the sangoma tremisana. It then would reconsider the proposed of de gazettement as the forest as a bequest from the ancestors. And then you have the two blockades that were erected by the Orang Asli, the two deck village in para beginning of the year, for example. And then you have the Tamia or an athlete of glamazon, Clinton, and then in 2019, very big event, I think it was covered quite nicely attended by 1000, or as leaders and advocates for the national or as the convention with the Ministry of Rural Development, and 136 resolutions was covering different aspects of around three lives, and then promising changed by the speech of Dr. Mahathir at the time about acknowledging principle of free prior and informed consent fpac to ensure that every plan development and welfare program will benefit the community by not sidelining the interests. And of course, this year, you have 40 pendants from Sarawak, for example, still having this kind of problem, different types of protests. But what I feel that really effective is a protests like you see on the slide there. This kind of activism. And the artists, tamale artist, Shaka, yo, yeah. So he did this. He's a very close friend of mine. So he used to exhibit his art, which exclusively features around us live folk, and various aspects of your life. Okay, so he basically believed that in combining art and activism, and that's why he will not keep silent when his own village is under threat. So he was one of the person individual who lived his whole village, in protesting silently, they were putting up like signage on the tree, on the Instagram, everybody was doing something and write something put on the Instagram, you know, like I think Zakiah was mentioning about how social media is very effective in to bring mass protests, mass resistance, so it really works, thanks to this digital platform. So and Okay, can we go to the next slide? So this is how key he, he conveyed a message about loss of land about taking of land and abuse of land rights of the Rosli this image is very powerful. The first time I saw this image, I was like, wow, this is very, very powerful with the clouds with the black palm oil and there is no Green at all left, it really shows how, how palm oil kill our land how palm oil kill the Orang Asli, land and end with the traditional cloth. He just look at that. And to my mind when I see this, I feel like I feel like crying actually, the first time I saw this, yeah, it really touched your emotion. You don't like the sadness, okay. But unfortunately, when this painting was published in the newspaper, they were just talking about Shah, they were not talking about the message that he was trying to convey through his writing. And that was very disappointing. And he himself was saying the same. He said, I'm trying to use media to convey my message. I'm not a journalist, I can only pay but hopefully that somebody will publish, what I see what I think about my painting through my painting, you know, he even put confession of all you

know exactly what's going on. So it would be nice if there is, every time there is issue about palm oil, you just put this image, you just put another image, you know, and you speak about what was going on, it will totally capture the public audience. Yeah. Next. Okay. So this is another painting of his, when I first saw this, I did not actually see the great part of the painting, I was focusing on the lady and I saw green, after I look at that lady, only, then I realize there's actually two different phase of landscape in this painting. And this painting was hanging at the research center from 2018. Until, until 2020, a lot of students came to the Research Center, the first thing they saw was, they said, Doctor, this painting is very powerful, because it shows the change. It shows the negative impact of development, you know, students can actually see it, it's very, very strong. And I was supposed to teach a course called Sustainable Development. And it get them to think about, okay, sustainable development, is development really sustainable, you know? So finally, I have to change the course, sustainable versus development, because development does not mean progress. So this painting actually changed the whole course and change the perspective of my students, when they think about progress, because of projects because of top bottom development towards the indigenous people and also towards any other who has been affected. Yeah. Okay. But again, it was never reported that way. This picture came out many times in the newspaper. Thanks. Now Chetco does not only advocate on ecosystem, palm oil, land rights, but he also advocate on art itself. Yeah. So he he used to use Canvas and do a lot of his own technique. But finally, a few years ago, he started to paint on the karma Kuang woven mat. And then I asked him, I said, Why do you use the karma Aqua? He was saying we all know that the mengkuang is used on the floor and the floor is always the lowest level and rank because we step on it. So he said I just want to put the mengkuang is something that can be appreciated as art is that just putting it on the floor and therefore I paint on it. So each of the ticker mengkuang that he used to pay he never put it on the floor of course, because nicely packed that you put it in the frame. So he changed totally the perceptions of the ticker Hong Kong. Okay. But what reported is only reported that new technique of sharp look, drawing on the woven mat, but no one ever asked, What is the significance of painting on the overnight. See, these are the aspect that we always leave out. Yeah. And then he only paint ladies who actually weave the mat and I was asking him to paint me on the mat, and he just casually said, if you weave your mat and I will paint you on your mat, you know, but that's never going to happen. Yeah, so, he is advocating not just for the ecosystem environment, but also the product that comes out in the environment in order to make people to know that these are all coming from the environment that it has to be appreciated by putting the faces that he loves, yeah. Okay. Next, I have a lot to share, but I think I will need to be very fast, how much time I have, okay. So, this one is very interesting as well, okay, 10 minutes. He, he basically draw this old guy here as you can see, and this old guy is the community leader who joined with him to lead his village people in other villages, to go for protests, they even went to Bersih you know, so in, in order to honor Him and to speak to the world that this man is very important, the most progressive or as leader, he painted him on the map that his wife woven and has brought this painting everywhere in his exhibition. By speaking about his involvement, his role is important role as the head meant to bring the community to be aware of their rights, okay. Next. Yes, okay. This is a very sentimental story for me. I am an activist to this reason why I use activism. So here I'm using activist to do my activism. And I was heading center for Malaysian Indigenous Studies. And, and, and the purpose of me doing this because I want to show to University of Malaya that look indigenous people in this higher institution is very significant. Why there is no division of Indigenous Studies, why indigenous courses are not offered why indigenous culture have not been

introduced in this university, we have a huge numbers of faculties, not even a single one has Indigenous Studies. So I asked, shot to draw in this double storey building. Next Sunday, I just want to show you the pictures. Next. Yes. Okay. So there's another one that he painted. The Orang Asli boy, and at that are asleep. Boyd painting was actually sponsored by education New Zealand and New Zealand High Commissioner even came to officiate that painting, and have a small ceremony. And at the bottom, I was asking Brendan Scott to draw the master weaver that I have worked with because he she has been awarded as the master weaver of UNESCO. But nobody ever give her recognition. So my way to give recognition is by collaborating with shot and also Brendan to put these faces. But what I didn't know is that University of Loja doesn't allow faces. And at one point, I was actually asked to paint over this mural, but as an act of protest, I refuse. So I just refuse to answer the email, basically. So the mural painting is still there, but I'm out of the center, but at least it's your standing day. So please go and take pictures. And please tell our stories, you know, because this is the only place at public university, you can see the faces of indigenous people. Okay, next. That's the Center for Malaysian Indigenous Studies. Those are those beautiful mural. And some people complain saying that this person is looking so scary, but international students would go there and take pictures. So this is beautiful. It strongly advocate the indigenous people. So we have two different kinds of you know, local versus foreign ideas. Let's next Okay, so that's me, standing there. Hang on. Let's get this mystery there. Just to show that this is my space. I have the right to be there. And I have the right to defend that duty, but I have no longer be able to be there. And this is the pictures with the userland High Commissioner proudly officiated that face there. Okay, next. Okay, I don't think we have much time. But let me mark know what interesting about her. She's also someone she's a contemporary artist, I would like you to, to. Okay, I would like you to look into her YouTube videos how she draw. So it's all about her drawings. But if you realize there's a orange flower here next. There is another type of flower. There's another type of flower. Next. There's all with flowers. I asked people did they notice the flowers? They say, Oh, we just look at how she drove. We just asked her. What is her vision, her mission? You know, but no one ever asked why different flowers and what does each flower symbolizes? She was trying to convey her cultural heritage. The meaning of the flowers actually mean something, but nobody has ever asked. But I asked her personally. Yeah, okay, next. Okay, so I just want to conclude here. So, as you can see there various other results. So communicating new perspective, questioning the status quo, speaking out about belief and inspiring others to take action. And activism often shares some of the same underlying motivation. So it's just that it's like the painting of the corner girl, you just have to look at many different exhibits. Yeah. Sometimes we tend to see just one. One way, one way street. We sell them do a u turn and go the same way, you know, so it's good to get lost, sometimes you do U turn and you revisit the space. Okay, do I have next slide? I don't even remember. Okay. So, okay. So, this is the political world is a cultural world. So, everyday act of resistance is actually everyday lifestyles. I mean, even you have your act of activism each day what we do to prove our points, it is an act of activism. Okay, I will stop here. Yeah, this kind of the you can talk until the cows come home.

Zakiah Koya 2:27:56

Thank you so much, Dr. Welyne. It's it's very, very, very cold, engaging to see such passion among academics especially, you know, especially when we're talking about issues which are not always played openly in the mass media. And as you said, art is resistance. I mean, art from the those days in the caves, it came from resistances because someone told them not to write on the walls and they did

write on the wall. We have in other countries are cartoons. So tires, they are big, in a in Southeast Asia where many times we are told not to express our feelings not to express what we are supposed to be polite. We are supposed to be polite people. Satire is one way of saying things, you know, and getting our message across. In Malaysia, we I think we have a family Reza, who's very good at planning, you know, the current issues. And then we used to have a lot. Although he wrote, he drew for a very, very pro. What he called government newspaper in those days in the 60s 70s and 80s and 90s. A lot was the face of Malaysian cartoonist panning politician, one of them. Many people don't realize this, but I think he was one of our first to actually poke fun at our politicians. But we also have on the other hand, the local cartoonists, you know, in Thailand in what he called in Philippines in Vietnam in Cambodia, they are very, very, very active in their own local language because some things are can only be understood by the locals that foreigners might not understand. For example, a Thai saying a certain words may be different, you know, the meaning might take on a different note, as compared to Malaysians. We are very good at, you know, having double meaning with our words, with our art with our cartoons. We might people might think it's nothing we have a version of the Mad Magazine Kilakila Yeah, the people think there is nothing sinister in it. But I think a lot of politicians of our leaders actually grew up reading that and become politically inclined mad itself is a cartoon, which is very politically, you know, in satire. So, then we have it's interesting to see that you also brought about how reporters should be writing should be questioning. And I think what you meant was this, humanize humanize the stories. Touch the readers and many of us are just reporters. At the end of the day, a lot of us are not fit to use the word journalists for ourselves. I myself, I'm ashamed to use the word journalist because journalists are high ranking is a high ranking term for a reporter that does more than just report in many times we are near reporters. So I think when you said what he called, engage humanize, for example, bring in the people factor. So that that is interesting. I hope we get some ideas from that. I definitely got a lot of ideas from that. Well, we move on we are we are shut off. We have we are running out of time. And then we we have our final speaker for the day is Dr. Eduardo C. Tadem, who is a professional lecturer from the of Asian Studies from the Asian center used to the Philippines Diliman and Dr. Eduardo is a he's got a very long list of what a PL CV so he is the co chair and he is the let me read this again, the convener of the program on alternative Development Ministry of flippin Center for Integrative and Development Studies, UPC IDs out there. Is that it Dr. I'm not sure I've said it correctly. He is co chair of the Asian regional exchange for new alternatives arena and a founding governing board member of the consortium of Southeast Asian Studies in Asia. So, as he said, as Southeast Asia, he has 142 publications in books academic journals and periodicals on the political economy of foreign aid, Southeast Asian regional integration civil society peasant society, agrarian reform and Rural Development, civil society industry studies, Mindanao regional development rural unrest and social movements, Philippine Japan relations conflicts over natural resources, international labor migration, foreign investments, special economic zones and contemporary politics. So with such a CV, I think we have a very important person who will be presenting this speech not speeches lecture on Southeast Asian civil society engagement with the ASEAN process challenges and alternatives. You have 30 minutes Dr.

Dr Eduardo C. Tadem 2:34:16

Thank you very much. Thank you and thank you very much to the Kini Academy for inviting me for this masterclass seven under the SEAFORE program. It's an honor to be here and such distinguished

company scholars and activists. So let me begin by sharing my screen okay, Just as an introduction, let me just state that the perceived inability of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations or ASEAN to meaningfully address the issues and concerns of Southeast Asian peoples is viewed by the ASEAN Civil Society Conference essay on people's 404 ACCA. PF is rooted in science being locked in a market center then state supported process that was conceived by regional and national elites to perpetrate control over the region's natural resources and productive capacities. Civil society sees a say and leaders making decisions without the meaningful participation of marginalized and disenfranchised peoples in the region, and are accountable only to narrow vested interests of economic elites and political oligarchies. This has only further widened the gap between rich and poor within and among countries and cost unparalleled debasement of the environment. nccap believes that a sense continued adherence to a new live to a neoliberal model of development prioritizes corporate interests and elite groups over the interests of Southeast Asian peoples. Now, ACCA PF has been engaging with the ASEAN process since 2005. But an in house assessment, or evaluation by the civil society network says that 10 years of engagement with the official SA and process from 2005 to 2015 has been consistently characterized by a prevailing silence and lack of attention and response to the observations and recommendations raised in all previous ACCA PF statements. As a result, some civil society groups recommend a radical restructuring of civil society engagements with Southeast Asian states by crafting a new people's regional integration order in order to implement an agenda independent of the state and the corporate bias essay and process. Now just a brief background on a short notice established in August 1967 and five countries, but later on Bri joined in 1984, Vietnam in 1995. Lao, Lao PDR and we unmarked for 999 Seven, and finally Cambodia on in 1999, making a purchase today to 10 member states of us. It has been pointed out by previous speakers, Timor Leste has been applying to join us as for several years now, but simply been put on an observer status actually the other country in Southeast Asia that is on observer status is Papua New Guinea. So in effect, we actually have 12 Southeast Asian countries are supposed to be part of a series that are not just to go through the aims. Very quickly, we're saying you have accelerate economic growth, social progress cultural development, promote regional peace and stability, promote active collaboration and mutual assistance on matters of common interest. Provide a system to each other in the form of training and research collaborate more effectively, to encourage further growth in agriculture, industry and trade sectors. In other words, the entire economy of Southeast Asia, promote Southeast Asian Studies and finally maintain close and beneficial cooperation with existing international and regional organizations. Now, these are the principles that guide a say and as a result of a treaty entered in 1976. You have mutual respect for independence, sovereignty, quality, territorial integrity and national identity of all nations the right of every state to lead its national existence free from interference from any other member countries or subversion or any coercion, non interference in the internal affairs of one another settlement of differences or disputes peacefully enunciating the threat or use of force and effective cooperation among themselves later on, we'll see that some of these principles have created problems in terms of addressing issues that I've that affect peoples of south southeast Asia, including, for example, human rights, democracy, Rise of authoritarianism, and others. Now, the main forum for CSO engagement with sa n is the essay and Civil Society Conference essay and people's forum ACCA PF this was for me 2005 and it is a network of Southeast Asian civil society organizations and social movements to bring attention to the issues and concerns of its constituencies. That is the working class the peasantry, urban poor, fisherfolk, women, children, LGBTQIA plus community, indigenous peoples

or their persons, ordinary rank and file employees, professionals, students, persons with disabilities and migrants. In engaging with ASEAN, the CSCs, or network has focused on organizing national consultations dialogues with government counterparts, regional consultative meetings, crafting the annual ACCA TF state statement, holding a parallel conference with the ASEAN Summit, mass mobilizations and an interface with a say and leaders. It has been the hope of the network that the engagement process will result in meaningful and substantial dialogues with government leaders and decision makers and lead to basic and essential reforms and changes in ASEAN. Unfortunately, there is hardly been any progress in making a say and recognize civil society's legitimate concerns, let alone seriously implement a range of proposals presented at the annual summit of ASEAN and sub state. Indian the attitude shown by ASEAN in its dealings with civil society groups can be best described as tokenism. It has been a frustrating and unproductive 16 years of ACRC APS India engagement with us as an internal ACCA Pf 10 year review. 2005 To 2015 concludes that and I quote, ASEAN and its member governments have been seen to be more comfortable with the private sector and academic and research think tanks, then with civil society and code and that code. Individual ASEAN member countries have consistently resisted and facilitated with regard to civil society participation and engagement. In various statements issued since 2015, all the way to just this year 2021. Essay, ACC ATF has repeatedly expressed frustration over the lack of attention to civil society concerns. For example, in 2016, the Timor Leste statement says that CNC will society remain extremely concerned about science prevailing silence and lack of attention and response to the observations and recommendations raised in all previous NCSEA PF statements in 2015 and 2017 statements. This were in Kuala Lumpur, as well as in Quezon City, Philippines, respectively. The network criticized the development paradigm of ASEAN member states, which it claims and I quote, as only bred greater inequalities accelerated marginalization and exploitation, inhibit peace, democracy and social progress, spawn economic, social and environmental crisis, extensive human rights violations, situations of conflict and violence and wanton exploitation of natural resources that are overwhelming the region's ecosystems in 2019. The ACC ATF also noted that CSOs and people's movements have argued that the changes in science perspectives or the announced changes in science perspectives and its pronounced tilt towards prioritizing Southeast Asian people's welfare have been more rhetorical than real. Meaningful people's participation in government programs, projects and decisions are nowhere to be found. Indeed, assailant is seen by independent observers as working to preserve and expand the role of traditional political oligarchies sorry, economic corporate elites. The same sentiments were raised in the night in the 2020. ACC statement in Vietnam. And lastly in the 2021 Gallery, just this year, in October, which was held online, where it was stated that the network found the common features of repression, exploitation and control mechanisms that operate in Southeast Asia during the COVID 19 pandemic, and share and shows that the people of Southeast Asia shared common situations and concerns about exploitation and domination by by national elites, oligarchs and ruling economic classes that strengthens authoritarian power of the state. To some to summarize a/c APS concerns you have here the lack of popular participation, rising inequalities, weakening democracies, human rights deficits, Elliot center development policies, the lack of a regional unifying identity, weak social protection and gender inequalities. Science reporting of being people oriented people Center, which they actually pronounced as early as 2007 is not matched by its actions and attitude, Visa V civil society and social movements and marginalized peoples of Southeast Asia in general. A sense patronizing and condescending attitude toward CSOs is reflected in how the body officially characterizes CSOs. The

2012 essay and guidelines on accreditation for civil society, organizations define a CSO, as I call a nonprofit organization of ASEAN entities, natural or juridical. That promotes strengthens and helps realize the aims and objectives of the ASEAN community and its three pillars. Similarly, the guidelines issued on February 2015, by the ASEAN inter government governmental Commission on Human Rights or ITER, defined CSOs as association of persons natural or jewelry because that is nonprofit, non governmental in nature, which are organized voluntarily to promote strengthen inhealth to realize the aims and objectives of Australia and activities. ASEAN encourages CSOs to seek accreditation with it, in order to be granted the opportunity and privilege of participating in ASEAN activities unquote. Notice here a sense, patronizing tone in refusing to recognize CSR participation as a right, only a privilege and opportunity, approval of accreditation. However, an AI code shall be based primarily upon the assessment of the positive contribution, which such a CSR could make to the enhancement strengthening and realization of the aims and objectives of ASEAN, and that the objectives of the CSR activities should be consistent with the aims and objectives of ASEAN. In other words, CSOs are expected to merely adhere and follow a science aims and objectives. Obviously, the essay on definition of an attitude towards CSOs are self serving, and run counter to internationally accepted definitions and status of CSOs as independent and autonomous players who have their own vision, and goals that may not necessarily coincide with state and official government vision and policies. As the United Nations Development Programme UNDP, as well as the Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development, or OECD pointed out and I quote, CSOs are voluntary or voluntary organizations with governance and direction coming from citizens are constituency members, without significant government control, participation, or representation. Even as the ACCA PF continues to express its dismay, over essay and strike record we serve its peoples. It is also somehow hampered by an apparent misunderstanding and confusion about the real nature of the essay and project. In the 2016 press release, the organization appears to plead for a say and governments to recognize civil society code not as a threat, but as an important ally in ensuring the realization of human rights for all Australian citizens. This equity vocal attitude to my mind is further reflected in the following statements incorporated in the 2016 ACCA PF statement and I quote, we reaffirm our commitments to monitor and engage in the essay and process processes towards a people centric ASEAN as Member States continue to aspire for political cohesiveness, economic integration and in maintaining a socially responsible people oriented and rules based ASEAN. This apparent ambivalence of ACCA PF towards ASEAN, reflected accurately reflects contrasting attitudes and a lack of consensus among the various groups within the network. Some groups see no other recourse but to continue the engagement in ASEAN, following the same processes and activities that they have been doing in the past, despite the lack of meaningful results. Others on the other hand feel that continued engagement is futile and a waste of time and resources. In succeeding ACCA PF gatherings however, the push for an alternative regional process would gain momentum, even as engagement remain on the agenda. Since the 2017 assembly in the Philippines in Quezon City, the ACCA PF has moved towards acknowledging the need for an alternative form of engagement, the ASEAN and also for an entirely new regionalism process, sounding the alarm for the shrinking space for civil society to effectively shape the agenda and policies of ASEAN and their respective governments. The 2017 ACCA PF statement resolved to an AI code, develop and adopt a new vision for engagement by civil society with a say and based on greater People to People interactions that will establish expand and strengthen a new people's regional integration process based on the alternative practices of people's networks and organizations across

the region societies. To highlight the importance of developing a Southeast Asian peoples alternative regional integration in 2019, the ACCA PF in its statement identifies the following tasks to be undertaken by the Regional CSO network and I call given the years of ACCA PF engagement with the official si and process have been met with lack of attention to the to the recommendations raised, resulting in minimal outcomes in the substantive improvement in the lives of our peoples to undertake a process for an alternative peoples regional integration. Based on the alternative practices of communities, sectors can networks. The movement for an alternative social for an alternative, Southeast Asian regional integration took shape in the latter half of 2017. At the University of the Philippines Center for Integrative and Development Studies, a program on alternative development was established by scholar activists who have been part of previous ACC ABF gatherings. Our main objective was to look at alternative paradigms, policies, practices and projects that have been largely marginalized and excluded from the mainstream. And to bring these alternatives out of the margins and into the mainstream, in order to level the playing field. The starting point for developing a people's regionalism was to acknowledge that Southeast Asian peoples and communities have for many years, and on their own been engaged in alternative heterodox and non mainstream practices that encompass economic, political and social cultural aspects. People to People interactions and networks have been set up. These alternative practices and interactions are seen as the building blocks for an alternative model of regionalism. In addition, popular practices also constitute a rich trove of empirical data that need to be distilled, subjected to the rigorous test of comparisons, and finally conceptualized and developed into a new paradigm, a narrative a framework, a theory or a guide to action. economic alternative practices constitute on the production side. These are examples, social enterprises, producer cooperatives and communities, engaging in exchanges on the technologies of food production systems that are environmentally friendly and sustainable. So examples are organic family farming, agro ecology and biodiversity, zero waste production and indigenous agronomic practices in the marketing aspect direct consumer direct consumer producer linkages via the media alter trade organizations and producer and trading cooperatives. In financing there are credit cooperatives and alternative currency systems. In the power sector, bright prospects exist for community based renewable energy systems such as solar, wind and biogas technologies. Political alternative practices you have informal and formal networks of civil society organizations and social movements that have been operating for decades, joint political advocacies and corresponding actions have been undertaken via mass mobilizations during international gatherings, as well as lobbying with states and multilateral organizations. alternatives to traditional political parties have also emerged. While direct actions are undertaken by people's organizations or spontaneously by marginalized and deprived communities for example, the unilateral occupation of land and housing projects. Communities have also engaged in integrated regional socio economic planning, and have practiced age or conflict settlement mechanisms. In the area of social alternative practices, you have self help groups, local networks were coordinated their social protection activities. Examples are community based health systems, alternative learning practices, such as phone, schools, non formal centers, and lifelong learning advocacies and provisions for a people oriented shelter program using indigenous designs, technologies and construction materials. And then lastly, you have your cultural alternative practices which was highlighted recent in the previous presentation by Dr. Whelan, which I find very entertaining and illuminating, and informative as well. On the cultural aspect, visual artists and other performers have been networking. Through regional events that showcase the richness, diversity and historical

depth of Southeast Asia's creative arts. More significant political and economic issues that are the concern of civil society groups, social movements, and marginalized peoples are also highlighted and represented via this cultural interactions and presentations. In 2020, a landmark decision was made during that year's ASEAN people's Forum, which was held in hybrid and blended forums, and hosted by Vietnamese civil society organizations. And this is the resolution on alternative regional integration for Southeast Asian peoples, which was approved by the plenary in a gathering. And these are the pertinent sections of that resolution. Southeast Asian peoples grassroots communities have, for many years been engaged in alternative heterodox and non mainstream practices, that ATF shall adopt the new vision for engagement by civil society, when I say and based on people to people interactions, rather than state to state relations or purely market oriented interactions, that this new vision shall lead to the establishment of a new people's regional integration process. And furthermore, the new Southeast Asian peoples regional integration shall be based on the alternative practices of people's networks and organizations across the region society. So, in other words, they should now be a regional regional integration from below rather than what I say and yes, which is a regional integration from above. So in terms of concrete outcomes, so this initiative thus far, what we have accomplished is number one, the documentation flow field research of identify. Sorry for the documentation through field research have identified case studies of alternative practices in several Southeast Asian countries. Number two, three regional conferences in November 2018, October 2019, and November 2021. Most of the participants were practitioners from Southeast Asian grassroots communities, and CSOs who are part of the ACC APS network. In this conferences, participants share their experiences from the documented alternative practices and interacted with each other. The documentation and the three conferences has so far produced about 60 cases of alternative practices of a political, social, economic and cultural nature, Indonesia, Philippines, Thailand, Timor Leste, Burma, Myanmar, Laos, Cambodia, Malaysia, Vietnam and in the Thai Burma border. The third concrete outcome was a people to people exchange activity held on July 2126, lat five or six days in 2019 in West Java and Jakarta, Indonesia, hosted by the Confederacy pergerakan backcap, Indonesia, or the Confederation of Indonesian people's movements KPI. This was proposed by participants at the November 2018 regional conferences, and enabled participant practitioners from different countries to learn from each other, as they are oriented on existing alternative community based practices undertaken by the hosting organization. For future activities moving forward, the following steps have been identified the conducting of alternative learning and training programs based on grassroots needs, mobilizing the entire universe of alternative practices, regional interactions and communities, and organizing joint actions and initiatives, promoting the replication of the alternative practices in order to mainstream them. Establishing a re regional mechanism at the civil society level that is based on the interactions and cooperative practices between these alternative practices. And finally, hopefully, this is the bigger project, I suppose, conceptualizing and making sense of all of these practices, and developing new paradigms and strategies of development. So in conclusion, the 16 years of engagement for the official ASEAN process has taught civil society movements in Southeast Asia valuable lessons that should guide its future trajectories. The real challenge facing regional CSO networks, like ACC APS today lies beyond the established OSI and process and should be firmly linked and tightly interconnected with the grassroots initiatives and the creative practices of real peoples struggling to carve a better and more dignified future life for their families and communities. In the process of building an alternative regionalism through the documentation of existing practices on the ground, and the various regional

interactions that have taken place, what surfaces are the principles of solidarity, collectivism, social equality, cooperation, mutual benefit, and the commons. Moreover, the judicious and responsible use of human natural resources and the need for peaceful and harmonious relationship with other peoples, and with nature, and the and the environment, also figure prominently. Thank you very much for your attention.

Zakiah Koya 3:03:23

Thank you, Dr. Eduardo, I think we got an overall view of what ASEAN has done and what we are doing and what we should be doing. More future. That's one question. We'll go straight to the questions. Question and Answer session. There's one question for Dr. Eduardo being fresh off from your lecture just now. The Ascend organization was formed in the midst of Cold War. When leftists movements were often perceived as potentially subversive. You know, there's this history affect us Ian's approach to civil society movements today. You know, especially when it inhibits regional integration from below.

Dr Eduardo C. Tadem 3:04:17

Well, I I've already outlined the various obstacles and challenges that face say in Southeast Asian civil society movements with respect to engaging with essay and and yeah, it is true, as the question has been posed that essay and was established during the height of the Cold War, and it was mainly a gathering of five anti communist states. But of course now, it is no longer that it is now, more than just a political organization which, which was was originally in our NSA and free trade association, you know four pillars that they stand on economic, political, social, cultural. So, are the three pillars Sorry, just the civil society has been asking us to form a fourth pillar on a pillar on the environment, which it has repeatedly refused to consider. So, it is no more than just a Cold War type of political organization since now includes communist states, like Cambodia, Laos and Vietnam. And it is now more in line with what we could call the neoliberal paradigm of development in terms of the market oriented free trade oriented letting the market decide the development in the ASEAN region and promoting trade and investment within within within say, among the different members. So, that is now been the more overriding concern and an objective of course, it still has the political aspect of trying to avoid conflicts, rather, should they say trying to put to sweep conflicts under the rug, because they don't they don't really address conflicts within between countries and also between countries they simply ignore them because of that prevailing principle of non interference in each other's country's internal activities.

Zakiah Koya 3:06:53

I would also like to ask, you know, we seem to have not touched much in all our presentations on because ASEAN is supposed to play the unifier role at the same time, take us in countries to the next level, but then we have like you said they tend to sweep it under the carpet or wear their blinders with the question is, you know, we have to very, very important to small countries, not not very small Myanmar's not very small to two countries which are facing where the people are facing, are trying to have been in resistance for so long. And now they are wanting to join ASEAN fully as members but they're not the people are not getting the support because the leaders are either, you know, because we have economic ties with Myanmar. Or you know, we have already called we don't want to the Asian style of don't want to snap the neighbor, you know, that kind of thing. So, Timo Leste and Myanmar, a to

Dr Eduardo C. Tadem 3:08:17

sorry do you mean Timor Leste and Papua New Guinea, Papua New

Zakiah Koya 3:08:21

Guinea, but Myanmar is already in ASEAN. Oh, yeah. You remember that the when they discussed Myanmar, in the last ASEAN talks, it was just, you know, touch and go. So, a lot of issues were not addressed and did not really get to highlight it in the reports also. So do you think ASEAN will be open to talking about the media to the media about this resistance from ASEAN itself against stimulus from ASEAN itself to accepting Myanmar whatever the Judaize doing?

Dr Eduardo C. Tadem 3:09:10

I seriously doubt whether I say it was give you recognition to people's movements, that specially the democracy movements in in Burma, Myanmar, or for that matter, you're in Thailand. Because they will be they will see this as imperative interference in the internal affairs of other countries. So they will simply as they have been, in many occasions in the past, they'll simply turn a blind eye to this gross violations of human rights that are taking place within individual ASEAN member member countries, because the prevailing principle really is to respect the national sovereignty territorial integrity. And the internal processes taking place in each country. They may of course, issue some vague or general statements about promoting democracy, people's will and all that, but beyond that, they do nothing. They would simply tolerate Grace transgression. So human rights that are taking place in individual countries. This this whole notion of providing a unified stance, however, sometimes breaks down, for example, in the attitude towards China, for example, ASEAN is not united. There are countries in ASEAN, I'm sure you know, which countries they are, they lean more towards China or others, especially those who have territorial disputes with China are more critical of China and wish China to change its actions especially in the South China Sea. So there is no there is no unified stand on the part of a say and with respect to China or the South China Sea disputes over territorial waters, territorial waters, the other issuer, CNS failed to take a unified stand, or even take unified actions is more telling. And this is a this has to do with the COVID 19 pandemic. There has been no unified coordinated action on the part of ASEAN states to address the COVID 19 pandemic, there has been no sharing, there's been no cooperation. So it's been like each country is its each country to its own. There have been meetings, I know, highly publicized meeting, so say and leaders online, but they have not come up with any concrete plan or, for that matter, any concrete action in order to address the COVID 19 pandemic as an organization, as a regional organization.

Zakiah Koya 3:12:12

Right. Thank you, Dr. Eduardo, I would like to invite one of the participants on one from Vietnam. Because we have been talking about all the other countries and we have someone from Vietnam. We don't really know a lot of this happenings in Vietnam that goes on, because the most of it is are in the local language and very little consult in English. So one, do you think you could tell us what's going on in Vietnam? Is there a big resistance movement happening? Or is it just you know, vibrations on the ground?

Participant 3:13:00

Thank you very much for touching on me, honestly, I am quite concerned car this one is well recording and live streaming and the topic it really is limited in Vietnam. So, so but to you know, I I'm about resistance. You know, I think there's you know, a lot of underground thing that happened, I feel but for example, in practice, the media is not keen to cover for, you know, to be safe. And also we receive the either not to cover even, for example, if they are resistant, like for example, protests in in, in some country in Europe, because they right now, for example, in just for example, the industry in Austria, there are protests, again, the COVID-19 mandate vaccine. You know, we may not cover that we don't want to spread the feelings of you know, that to some Vietnamese people who also not like to have the vaccine. Not to mention for example, we not cover news about Burma, resistance or we say the term see what is this all based opinion something so we not cover that. We don't want to Gaiden that I understand it, we don't want to interfere into the the serenity, Burma country itself. So a lot of things in Thailand, for example, we don't want to cover the protests Again, the royal family. And for any photo that we eat, we cover for any photo that we use, we are not allowed to do any photo with the site. Yeah, so there's a lot of things going on, like the requirement for for, for for, for further media and heavy punishment, my newspaper is suspended for three months for the brain for the brain, a daily newspaper, we start. Yeah, we got to stop for three months completely in 2017. So we also have some scare in you know, we to be to play safe on it. I think I can discuss more off the record or more

Zakiah Koya 3:15:50

broadly. Yeah, I understand on one just wanted to have you participate a little bit in the class? You know, we are all talking about ourselves. Also, I, I have a question to pose to Dr. Cool. What does the what can the media do when they're faced with heavy handed authorities who act against those who report resistance? I mean, as as someone who's not only an academic, but also as an activist? What what, what would you advise young reporters or even senior reporters, you know, being out there knowing that there is freedom of speech, but no freedom after speech. So Dr. Khoo

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 3:16:49

Thank you, Zakia. I, since I'm not from the media industry, but I will assume the same thing goes for, with what happens to academics when we are faced with all these challenges as well. So I will advise that the first thing is, of course, media, you have your unions and associations that you can get the protections. Not sure if in the at the regional level, that you have a regional umbrella that protects the reporters. But I think, apart from that the lawyers, I think, lawyers from different countries, you have the networks that when to offer a system, at least in the context of Malaysia, I know, they are human rights lawyers that are on standby. And then they are also the unions and the journalists and media practitioners that could probably lend some assistance. But I was I can imagine that this kind of this form of assistance can be very challenging for some of the other countries in the Southeast Asia, in the case of like, Myanmar, Cambodia, and things like that. So I do come across that some who get the external assistance. However, I will probably put this forward to the media practitioners to actually form a stronger unions in order to protect the journalists as well, because when we talk about human rights defenders, basically journalists also fall into the same categories, especially for those journalists who actually covered the topics sensitive topics like this in the context of Southeast Asia on resistance, movement and social movements.

Zakiah Koya 3:18:43

Thank you, Dr. Khoo. Dr. Welyne, do you agree with Dr. Khoo when she says that journalists are human rights defenders, especially when you you you talked about indigenous communities and minorities? And most of the time, it's the human rights being trampled that brings out the visualization of resistance movements.

Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom 3:19:12

Um, it's it depends on the situation, I must say, but I do feel strongly that a lot of journalists out there that engage with the subject, the individuals or community, they really bring out the Human Rights debates, you know, they really address the basic human rights. So, in terms of indigenous people, I think there's there's a lot of room for improvement, because sometimes, it is a bit hard to to uncover the real situations because of Many reasons. Like for example, the case among non people, for example, it's not easy for you to write in details, because it's not easy to access. And, and I know that most of the stories about the anon has been written by foreign journalists who actually go there and leave their, you know, they sit there, and our local journalists, for example, has not been able to do the same. And I know the restrictions, firstly, because of permit permission. Secondly, journalists from, from our country, for example, they are very exposed in the sense that you guys always play by the rule, you know, like you always ask for permit before you go in, and of course, your permit will be revoked will be rejected as researcher, like him who were saying, I was, I am not a generalist, but I was denied of permit to do research as well. So I cannot imagine how how generalists would be allowed to go in, you know, so this, I said, it depends on the situation. Yeah. I hope that answered the question.

Zakiah Koya 3:21:13

Right. And you also mentioned about the, you know, progress and development of you, you know, media, media doesn't immediate takes it for granted that progress and development have, you know, come to these indigenous groups. And we also, many times told by our editors, that these are not sexy issues to cover, you know, these are not interesting, not sensational issues to cover. So, such reports, you know, sort of around asleep, or indigenous communities, I think it happens in other countries as well, where suddenly they are getting new houses, what pipe water electricity are reported? How, how does this kind of reports affect public attitudes towards this indigenous community? So what do you think

Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom 3:22:20

it's one of the public update, when I read news like that you don't like, the first question will be easy for election. There's a first, as we all know, you don't like nearing elections, there's a lot of politicians out there. I know, this is public, but sometimes you just cannot hold your tongue, you know, like, and I witnessed this in my own state, you know, politicians or people who would like to stand in certain region would come with their army, I call it with a few other peoples are talking about, like, we can give you this now, because we are taking advantage of the election. And, and we can actually put the road the electricity, if you want Wi Fi, you don't like every time before elections, you can hear that. Unfortunately, there is no journalists around to really cover the truth, you know, so. So we do questions, why suddenly these indigenous people get all these logistic problems. So have schools you know, this kind of thing.

So, there should be always questions, why they have it, not just not just to report and, and most of the time, you see the person who actually sponsor this, the housing, the schools, you know, in front of the media, and the community are nowhere to be found. And that is really like, for me, it's very sickening, you know, because the focus has to be on the people who receive if you just take one picture, okay, for example, if you go to I was covered research on the banane school dropout study, okay, but I signed a confidential, not to publish this study. And I know a lot of the a lot of a lot of corruptions in improving schools, building, building schools and all these kinds of things. Yeah, but we cannot say anything. So we are not supposed to publish it as academic journals. But I have all the reports in my office anyway. So anyone wants to write about it, you just come to my face and get it, you know, because we cannot publish it as academic journals. And I think that journalists should engage with activist academics, like enjoy myself and the others because we have this fan hot story. Just don't name the sources, you know, just write it down. Or it could be you, you just put one picture and then just write it down. It's, it's something like that. It's very, I tell you, the adrenaline wanted to publish this kind of thing is the same as you doing the blanket. Yeah,

Zakiah Koya 3:25:38

thank you. Dr. Welyne , we'll wrap up with, I just want to get a comment from each speaker. Just maybe two or three lines on what you think the reporters the media should do. When they are struggling with reporting resistance? Should they go all out? Or should we just get? Should we just be much more creative, especially in Southeast Asia, where we have to be polite, and nice, and not be like Western, which is it is what we always get if you ask the hard questions, or your Yo yo, like the Western reporter. So, you know, how do we how do we address that? Doctor Khoo. Maybe you could answer that.

Dr Khoo Ying Hooi 3:26:32

I think this is a very similar questions that always been put forward to the human rights activists as well. My view is that we do need to protect ourselves before we do anything otherwise. I mean, that's this, these things about some they have the perceptions were you know, if you're a human rights activists or defenders, you should defend all out and ignore every other things. I do not agree with such a view. Hence, I will certainly say that Please protect yourself. And that's why it is not I say, we do need a stronger unions and the networks to actually protect all of us who are working in this field. Yeah. Thank you.

Zakiah Koya 3:27:17

Thank you, Doctor Khoo. Dr. Eduardo, what do you think?

Dr Eduardo C. Tadem 3:27:22

Well, it has been said that journalism is now the most dangerous profession in the world today, for example, in the Philippines, no less than the Presidential Task Force on major security. So this is the government agency, as documented 187 journalists killed in the past 35 years. And in since President Tetrick came to power 21 journalists have been killed. There is a pattern going on here because most of the most of journalists getting killed are our journalists who are in the outlying areas in the local local areas, provinces, small newspapers, small bgn airports, there has not been actually any big journalists, from any of the major networks, or any anyone based in, in the Metro Manila Area, or major urban

centers, for example, that have been killed, although they have been subjected to harassment. The most prominent, of course, is Maria Reza, who was just accepted the Nobel Prize, Nobel Peace Prize together with another journalist from Russia. She has she's been charged with I don't know about 30 cases by the government, because her organization Rappler has been very critical of government. So she had to seek permission to go to Norway to receive the Nobel Prize. She was granted that she could only stay for five days and has to come come back. She's just out on life on bail, by the way. So the journalists are citizens also, in a large sense, they are part of civil society, actually, although they would like to think of themselves as part of the Fourth Estate. But since they're not government, and they're not also part of the market, we can actually consider them as part of civil society. So think that the to protect themselves is first organized themselves. And there are organizations already existing of journalists in the Philippines as well as in other countries, Southeast Asia, and in the world. And secondly, is to coordinate and make connections with other civil society organizations, social movements in order to strengthen their voice, so that they can be easily defeated. But so that you cannot say that they stand alone in, in protecting in protecting the rights of journalists to say it as it is.

Zakiah Koya 3:30:12

Right. Thank you, Dr. Eduardo. Okay. Dr. Welyne? What do you think? Do you think we should we should start weaving?

Dr Welyne Jeffrey Jehom 3:30:26

No, you don't have to weave. But in general is a human, you know, they have human rights. So if, if in places that is almost impenetrable, why not use informants? For example, you know, I mean, I've seen in movies, some journalists, like, using some informants to penetrate some kind of hard, difficult issues, for example, in order to protect themselves, so. So it doesn't mean that you have to be there, then that instead there and then to, to report all the details. But if I look at some of the I'm sure you all know about the one MDB cases with Mrs. Brown, for example. I mean, the way she took things a bit, a bit too drastic to progress, in the sense that she was risking herself to travel in the interior, you know, to expose yourself to the state government for examples in he, she has a lot of changes. Of course, it makes her famous at the same time, she is covering the things as well, but I do think that some of our dissent, journalists is not wanting to make themselves famous, but they would like to report such things. So protections for themselves is very important. And I do feel that community can actually protect them in certain way. If they really do go into the community. Right.

Zakiah Koya 3:32:02

Okay, we have come to the end of the class. Thank you so much. It was very enlightening. To hear from people passionate about the topic, Dr. Khoo, I know, I have followed her for many, many years, I have yet to meet her. And I have seen her in person I've yet to meet her in person. You know, Dr. Welyne, you're much sought after very respected. Dr. Eduardo have read your papers for decades, when talking about Philippines and all that, and the participants, very, very patient participants. Thank you so much to Kini Academy. Thank you very much. I will now take my leave and hand it over back to Danny. Thank you, Danny. And thank you all.

Danny Yong 3:32:56

Oh, no. Thank you to all the speakers. Really! What a great discussion. I think the what's shared today, I think it's rarely heard out there. And we're glad that we have this forum to get your views out there and your perspective out there for for all to consider. So thank you for the offer you keep fighting the good fight. We don't be surprised when you get a call from me or a text from me. We in our work with investigative journalism we do. We do take it upon ourselves to pursue stories that that needs to be and and I hear your call is open call for us to reach out to you and have our journalists work with you to chase down those stories. So that's that. And thank you for all the participants for staying on. And we this the end of our master of our series, a master class, they won't be any more in December at least, as I mentioned, I do we do plan to have a repeat of this at least for next year. And do reach out to your colleagues to collaborate. There's plenty of opportunities in Belize to prove the rest of the world wrong that ASEAN journalists do not reach out enough to each other across the border to chase out stories that are of interest. You know, I know the the journeys in the Mekong Delta, the Mekong region area have got many cross border stories that cross border incidents that warrant you know, this sort of cross border effort so you know, there's there's plenty of them in our group. So meanwhile, I hope you guys will will complete the surveys at least a journalist and tell us what you think. As usual, we also want to get feedback from you guys to do things better, and to gauge the effectiveness of our session. As I mentioned, we fully intend to repeat this, of course with different topics next year. So your cert your your, your you completing the survey will be really helpful for us. So meanwhile, thank you again for the speakers if you guys wish to leave. It's alright so because we will we'll just finish up things here with the with our colleagues. Thank you again, everybody.

Muhammad Adib Faiz 3:35:43

Thank you. Thank you. Bye, bye. Stay stay safe.